

**SAPRI Methodology Workshop  
Sogakope, 10-13 August 1999**

**Day One August 11, 1999**

**I. OPENING SESSION**

- . **COUNTRY REPORT by Mr. Kwasi Adu Amankwah - Vice Chair, Tripartite National Steering Committee, SAPRI and Chairman of CivisoC**

**Background**

This meeting marks a significant step forward to completing the SAPRI process in Ghana. There has been lots of criticism about structural adjustment since it was initiated. SAPRI is not only the assessment of impact of these programmes, but also a co-operative review of the attendant policies by the Government, the World Bank and Civil Society. It was launched globally in July 1997 by World Bank President Wohlfensohn. Standard Operating Procedures and a Methodology Framework were agreed between the World Bank and international civil society organisations. However, because the World Bank's clients are first and foremost national governments, the agreement had to be endorsed by national governments. Seven governments agreed to subject themselves to the joint review process and there is now a constant exchange of experience.

The exercise is significant because it will reveal the true impact of structural adjustment. Disagreement has largely been expressed on the issue of impact. To some extent the Bank considers that Adjustment has done well whereas there is consensus among civil society groups that the impact has been largely negative.

SAPRI is being conducted in four countries in Africa: Ghana, Mali, Uganda and Zimbabwe; and three in other parts of the world: Ecuador, Bangladesh and Hungary. Although each country is being guided by the same procedures there are variations in implementation. Mali held its national forum in July 1999. Zimbabwe has yet to hold one. Uganda, the first to hold its national forum, has delayed activities to restructure participation in order to ensure that civil society representation is autonomous. Ghana is the only country ready to embark on the research phase, which is expected to be path breaking and has the potential to be able to advise other countries on best practice. In addition to the review, many countries have initiated economic literacy campaigns to raise understanding of both national and international policy making across the society.

Financing for SAPRI has come from independent governments and international civil society organisations and is held in trust by the World Bank. However, because not all pledges have been honoured, raising funds at local level has become necessary. This tends to slow down the process.

**SAPRI in Ghana**

In early 1997 a provisional civil society group in Ghana was formed to raise consciousness about SAPRI throughout the country. A conference was held in June 1997, bringing together a broad group of organisations to discuss the impact of SAP in Ghana. A number of issues were identified and organisations were grouped into various sectors. The Civil Society Co-ordinating Council was formed and a Tripartite National Steering Committee appointed. The official launch of SAPRI took place in November 1997. Thereafter papers were

commissioned in six major areas: (i) agriculture; (ii) microeconomic impacts on the mining and manufacturing sectors and employment; (iii) health; (iv) education; (v) governance; and (vi) gender. In addition World Bank documents were summarised and literature reviews prepared. This served as background documentation for the First National Forum, held in October 1998.

The National Forum started off in an atmosphere of suspicion and negative perceptions between the three groups. Most representatives used the platform to articulate their different standpoints on the impact of SAP, and questioned the commitment of other participants to the process. Over time these negative perceptions have given way to common understanding of the work ahead.

Structural adjustment has affected everyone personally for nearly two decades. The work that we are about to embark on will lay the framework for how structural adjustment is implemented in Ghana in the future, and how policy makers view these policies. In particular, it will affect the participation of civil society in policy-making and how the World Bank interacts with government and civil society in Ghana. In fact, the process is already changing the way policy is made. The World Bank has recently invited participation from civil society at a very early stage in the formulation of its Country Assistance Strategy, with a series of meetings starting in September. Our common purpose can be achieved if we work together as independent partners willing to compromise toward the objective of reforming the nature of economic and social policy making in Ghana.

### **Observation From the Floor**

The current need to involve civil society in economic policymaking by the Bank has very much coincided with the growth of civil society groups as complimentary forms of representation. The Bank has hitherto known only governments as the only legitimate forms of representation and had been further constrained by the requirement to lay all programmes before Parliament. With the growth of civil society groups however, an opportunity has been created for alternative forms of consultation. Civil Society groups should united and proactive to influence the process.

## **PRESENTATIONS**

### **A. POLITICAL ECONOMY AND SAPRI RESEARCH**

Kwesi Jonah, Lecturer, Department of Political Science, University of Ghana

This presentation was based almost entirely on one that was presented by Dr. Olukoshi at the Regional Methodology Workshop held in Ghana in July 1999. It has three basic sections:

- (a) a review of methodologies applied to structural adjustment
- (b) a description of political economy and its recent developments
- (c) applications to the proposed SAPRI-Ghana issue areas

#### **(a) Review of methodologies applied to structural adjustment**

There have been two main approaches to SAP impact research in Africa; the *before-and-after* approach; and the *with-and-without* approach.

The *before-and-after* compares the economic situations of countries after they have implemented SAP programs, with the situation that ensued before. This approach commonly finds that countries are in better shape after these programmes. The first problem is with non-equivalence in the types of programs that countries have followed. A second problem is that it does not take into account those countries that have implemented SAPs without WB/IMF involvement. Thirdly, the concepts of good and bad adjustment are so laden with value judgement that they are not useful. Fourth, the World Bank has varied its treatment across countries even while they are implementing adjustment programs.

The *with-and-without* approach compares the performance of countries with SAPs with countries that are not implementing SAPs. The common result found is that those with SAPs are performing better than those without. Typically, they have improved infrastructure, and agricultural output has grown. However, the Economic Commission on Africa (ECA) has drawn the opposite conclusion.

Both these approaches suffer from the difficulty of identifying *the counterfactual situation*. They are also plagued by a related and fundamental difficulty in attributing causation of either failure or success to the adjustment programme. In addition, they also have problems accounting for the effect of conditions external to the program, that affect the countries performance. In Africa these are typically weather conditions; rapid population growth; behaviour of international markets, especially for commodity exporting countries; and civil strife.

#### **(b) The approach of political economy and recent developments**

The study of political economy emerged from dissatisfaction with pure political science and pure economic research and studies the interplay of the two forces. The economy is seen as a system of production and distribution of goods and services and is represented by the market. The political system is a set of institutions and rules by which social and economic interactions are governed and is represented by the State.

Political economy refers to (a) the way government actions affect the operations of the market and (b) the way economic resources forces affect political actions. If the national and international economic systems functioned like perfectly competitive markets, they would be no reasons for political interplay. But in reality, political actors intervene in the functioning of the market, and market forces compel governments to make decisions that they would not have made otherwise. The State and the market cannot each one on its own allocate resources, and we must factor the reality of interaction between the two into our research.

#### **How do we do this? By posing certain political questions:**

- What are the political basis and consequences of particular economic decisions?
- In the adoption of certain economic policies, whose power and influence are crucial?
- When a policy is implemented who gets what and how?
- What is the economic basis and consequence of government actions?
- Are political policies intended to punish opponents and reward supporters?

There are different perspectives in political economy. We review three: (i) liberalism/ neo-classical approach; (ii) Marxism; and (iii) nationalism.

**(i) Liberalism/Neo-classical Perspective.**

This approach is based on work by Adam Smith and David Ricardo. It has three underlying assumptions:

- individuals are the principal actors within the economy and are the proper unit of analysis
- individuals are rational utility maximisers
- individuals maximise utility by making trade-offs between goods/services

Under this approach, there is no basis for conflict in political economy, provided markets are open and operate freely. The role of government is restricted to creating rules for market transactions, defending property rights and should avoid involvement in the production and distribution of goods.

**(ii) Marxism**

This was developed by Karl Marx for the domestic economic arena and extended by Lenin to the international sphere, coined *imperialism*. Marxism was developed as a direct opposition to the advocacy of capitalism inherent in liberalism. Capitalism is a system of exploitation, which creates extremes of wealth for capitalists and poverty for workers. The three basic assumptions are that:

- Classes and not individuals are the dominant actors and appropriate units of analysis. They are the two main opposed classes: capital and labour;
- Classes act in their material economic interest; and
- The basis of the capitalist economy is the exploitation of labour by capital.

**(iii) The Nationalist perspective**

This was developed in works by Hobbes and Machiavelli. The three assumptions of this approach are:

- ◆ Nation states are the dominant actors in political economy and are the proper unit of analysis;
- ◆ Nation states are power maximizers, and derive power from the use of force within domestic and international arenas;
- ◆ And that nation states are rational actors.

In adopting the political economy approach we should focus on five issues:

1. Implications of policy for power relations across class, gender, age and ethnic groups and the disaggregation of power in terms of its social components
2. Differentiation in the economy and society which reinforce or counteract patterns of structural inequity
3. The structure of ownership of assets and resources
4. Policy as the product of conflict of interests
5. The role of the State in policy formulation as central to investigation.

In 1980, a new political economy emerged which outlined public choice as the outcome of the balance of various interest blocks. The World Bank became interested in this approach for analysing why Structural Adjustment was accepted in some countries and rejected in others. Questions were raised about the timing, phasing, sequencing of adjustment reforms, with the objective of making recommendations toward achieving successful SAPs.

It was formerly believed that strong and even ruthless governments were necessary for successful adjustment. Public choice theory showed that the balance of interest blocks as constituency's for/against adjustment could explain different outcomes, and help design better programmes. These interest blocks are often presented as binary groupings, e.g. rural/urban, private/public, formal/urban. However, recently, many have begun to question some the relevance of these sharp dichotomies. For example, in Africa, society cannot be categorised by such sharp compartmentalisation of groups, as most of the population straddles these binary groupings.

#### Questions and comments

*Do the three approaches have different theories within each of them?* The approaches are not mutually exclusive. They interact, but depending on the weights attached to the relevant types of actors.

*How do we apply the five considerations into the 3 approaches?*

*Civil war is an extreme among the destabilising events that change the pattern of economic interests. Should we not include other forms of instability in considering outside events that may have affected the success of SAPs in Africa?* Civil war prevents economic activities, as opposed to other forms of destabilisation, which may simply change the pattern of interests rather than totally prevent economic activities.

*The rural urban may still be quite relevant in Ghana, despite the fact that urban dwellers still have allegiances and connections to their rural origins. For example, are remittances really forthcoming to the rural area from migrants to the urban area?* Remittances and transfers may go either way (from rural to urban areas and vice versa), so it is difficult to diametrically separate the two interests. However, we cannot do away with rural/urban groupings as an analytical dichotomy for policy making - the gap is real, but not complete.

*Does the **before-and-after** approach also have a data problem i.e. finding information for the historical baseline for different cross sections of society?* In general, yes there is a paucity of data before SAP during the period of economic decline, but there were some appraisals of the situation at the beginning of SAP in order to prepare those programmes. These can provide useful baseline information

#### **Applications to issues areas.**

*(The presenter followed next section by making direct reference to page 9-12 of the report of the Regional Methodology Workshop which relates to application of the theories to research).*

#### ***Mining: Key Issues to Serve as Entry Points***

1. It is important to take stock of the structure and pattern of mining investments and disaggregate what constitutes new investment and what is a windfall from divestiture by the State. The distinction between new investments and reallocations is very important.
2. There is the need to develop a notion of the reorganisation of the mining sector in the context of the history of previous re-organisations and how liberalisation fits previous policies.

3. Attention should be paid to the role of the State in terms of the incentives it offers to attract investors to the sector. It should be noted that the State also has a role in matters of security of investment.
4. Research should also direct attention to the communities in which mining investments are located by inquiring into the question of how much mining has dislocated community life.
5. Researchers should look at resources that are actually brought in by new entrants and the real value of assets that are brought in since some assets are over-valued. The actual developmental value of investments should be determined.
6. Research should examine the extent to which the mining sector has become a site for flight of capital.
7. Also to be scrutinised is the current balance between expatriate and local investors and the pattern of their distribution into small, medium and large-scale investors. There should be a sociological investigation into the kind of operators who constitute small-scale operators as well as medium and large-scale ones.
8. The remuneration of foreign experts as a proportion of the total remuneration should be looked into.
9. The question of sub-contracting of any of the investment activities also deserve attention.
10. The spin-off effects or linkages with other sectors and the forward and backward linkages are another major issue.
11. The value that is added locally to the product.
12. Extent of re-investment as compared with volume of profit repatriation.
13. The employment effect of mining operations, the local number of people employed, both full time and casual, local and expatriate, male and female and the marital status of local employees as well as the distribution of responsibilities and patter of remuneration.
14. Investor's commitment to staff training employee welfare schemes, structures of power, unionisation and non-unionisation of labour, structure of collective bargaining health hazard, dynamic of relationship between employees and employers and extent to which adjustment has shifted balance of power in favour of capital.
15. Notions of corporate responsibility in communities of mining companies, relationships between companies and communities – environmental health and social. Pattern of change of community brought about by mining investment. Evicted communities etc. Ways in which their power by buying and chiefs and community leaders with money and drinks investments corporation have made in education such as scholarships and who the beneficiaries are. Are the winners men, women or children of local elite? Compensation paid for loss of farmland. Who got what and for what?
16. Environmental cost of mining operations. Did the bigger players carry out environmental impact assessment procedures adopted by the companies?

### ***Trade policy and Manufacturing***

1. Uneven impact of Trade Policy on manufacturing sector. Initially research focused on the question of de-industrialisation. Now there is the need to disaggregate the manufacturing sector itself, as some industries such as food processing may not be as vulnerable as others such as garments and textiles.

2. There is the need to identify the relevant adjustment measure that affect manufacturing and how some aspects of the adjustment process tend to cancel out others.
3. Trade liberalisation and the lowering of tariffs to allow in imported manufactured goods and its consequences.
4. Another set of issues include access to credit and how easy or difficult it is under adjustment, liberalisation of the credit regime, interest rates and the cost of credit, abolition of import licenses: public sector retrenchment and the manufacturing sector especially manufacturers' concern about the lowering of purchasing power; the privatisation and commercialisation of state owned enterprises.
5. Dr. Olukoshi drew attention to the task of carrying out a census and profiling of the sector to establish the following facts:
  - (i) total number of firms
  - (ii) expansion arising from adjustment
  - (iii) consumer and capital goods
  - (iv) sub-sectoral distributions of employees
  - (v) manufacturing employment as a % of total employment
  - (vi) manufacturing as a % of GDP
6. Researchers should also focus attention on the patterns of investment in the manufacturing sector by establishing the following:
  - (i) type of investments in manufacturing
  - (ii) investments which established new manufacturing plants
  - (iii) sectoral distribution of investments in manufacturing
  - (iv) patterns of closure of old import substituting firms as a percentage of the rate of establishment of new firms
  - (v) Assessments of levels of capacity utilisation relative historic capacity use. In Africa as a whole capacity utilisation is about 40%.
7. Another set of researchable issues relate to capacity expansion and regimes of manufacturing under adjustment as well as the composition of imports over time. Is there an objective of improving export performance to promote export led growth through the so-called "sunshine industries"? Have the offering of banking loans local to investors created inequalities in the economy?
8. Researchers should take note that the debate has moved from the impact of adjustment on industries to survival strategies of firms. There is therefore the need to examine innovations, technologies labour relations, and technical adaptability reduction of workforce patterns of retrenchment and engagement. Also deserving close attention are strategies of stock-market floatation on non-stock market share offering associations of manufacturers and their internal politics? The vital question is on the whole manufacturers manufacture for survival or accumulation.
9. Finally it is worth finding out the extent of weakening or strengthening of intersectoral linkages and patterns of increase or decline in employment generation or creation of capital

## Questions and Comments

*What can we learn from the political economy of tobacco industry about applying political economy to the mining industry in Ghana?* It is similar to mining, in that the government has a lot of interest in the tobacco industry as a source of revenue, but it also has effect on the health of the people. The major difference is that with tobacco the hazard is associated with individual consumption and affects the individual first, while with mining the hazard accrues to the community as a whole, so the role for government is larger. In addition, tobacco companies in the US do not generally request subsidies, while mining companies in Africa lobby and compete for investment incentives/subsidies. In providing these incentives the government is implicitly taking a political position to protect mining investors' property over/against community interests.

*Some of the questions listed can be answered by pure economic analysis. Shouldn't we focus political economy approach on those questions that cannot be addressed by with economics or political science alone?* Answering some pure economics questions may enable us to answer some political economy questions, but we should use political economy approach to focus on some specific new questions that have not already been addressed.

*It seems that there still is some value added from the previous approaches of **with-and-without**, and **before-and-after**, so they shouldn't be completely discarded but all approaches should be utilised.*

*Can we still use the nation state as a unit of analysis, in an era of globalisation?*

## Some further guidelines for the upcoming research.

1. The literature review will eliminate some of the questions, which have been solved, find which questions have been half-solved, and which have not been solved at all.
2. The qualitative aspects of analysis require discussion in order to see different perspectives and requires that the necessary differences be solved by thorough democratic discussion. There should also be a proper forum for cross-fertilisation across the different issue teams.
3. We need to have a discussion on standard format for final reports, seeing that different groups came up with different approaches.
4. The benefits of political economy approach can be seen from the different presentations. For example, Groups 1 or 2 presented the historical perspective, and showed the usefulness of periodizing the information. Group 2 came to grips with definitional issues, while Group 3 focus political economy on the empirical facts rather than theorising.

## Day Two August 12, 1999

### I. INCORPORATION OF GENDER ANALYSIS INTO THE SAPRI RESEARCH. BY PROFESSOR TAKYIWAH MANUH (INSTITUTE OF AFRICAN STUDIES)

#### Preliminary Observations

*A question may be raised as to whether there is anything such as ‘feminist methods’ of research since nothing should debar men also from carrying out gender-situated research. It is therefore important to break the myth surrounding male participation in research centred on women. While this is true, it does appear from the current composition of research teams that women have not been represented. Such a situation would of course deviate from the very principle of participation. Efforts should therefore be made to involve women in the exercise.*

#### Women’s Issues vrs. National Issues

There is the tendency within the field of micro economic policy to compartmentalise situations broadly into “women’s issues” and “national issues”. Examples include:

- ❑ Violence against women which is generally perceived of as “an invitation to treat” by women themselves.
- ❑ Problems of drug abuse which is often attributed to poor parenting by mothers.
- ❑ Feeding (including breast-feeding) and nutrition issues which are classified as “welfare”.

Quite interestingly, the First National Forum gave concrete expression to these general perceptions about gender issues in Ghana. Discussions on gender during the forum was focussed on issues such as population, nutrition and credit.

#### HYPOTHETICAL QUESTIONS

**Issue 1:** To make this more explicit, one may pose a question such: Is building a road a woman’s issue?

#### REACTION FROM THE FLOOR

- ❑ Though remote, efforts are being made these days to include women in the construction business e.g. in Wa, a woman was selected as a road contractor (wrong context)
- ❑ It should concern women because of their marketing and transporting activities
- ❑ It is dangerous to use the term “women’s issue” because it is inherently discriminatory. All issues should be defined as a national issue. The question should be posed the other way around: E.g. should population issues be men’s issues?

Whilst it would be ideal to categorise all issues as national issues, reality dictates that society has maintained a culture of compartmentalising issues which disproportionately affect women. *What is must be separated from what ought to be* in order to reflect social reality. As researchers therefore, it would be important for us to desist from making assumptions before we go onto the field.

Lynn Kerr has sought to show that women are themselves agents of transportation. There is a general perception that they are carriers because they have stronger necks. Men are more associated with wheels or automobiles because they can afford it. Women on the other hand have to use their feet. While the general perception is that women should be significant beneficiaries of road construction the real situation on the ground shows that men are. It is no wonder therefore that NCWD, as the main women's machinery would never deal with issues affecting road construction. There would be the need to examine the root cause for such disparities, which may be embedded in traditional beliefs and culture such as in the way women dress up. In Dagbon for example, it has been found that men dominate in the use of bicycles because of existing patterns of division of labour which dictates that men dominate in firewood collection. The use of bicycles allows men to do this while easing women of the burden of head loading.

One however needs to be cautious because the example from Dagbon may be related to an opportunity to earn more money through bicycle use. This is comparable to the sudden male domination of sheanut picking by men from women when it suddenly became a lucrative venture.

**Issue 2:** Can we make assumptions of general neutrality when men and women apply for credit?

Application for credit procedures on Ghana appear to be gender neutral on the face of it. They however become gender blind and gender biased as soon as the element of collateral is introduced. While it assumes that both men and women can provide collateral, it is blind to the fact that in reality men tend to own real property, while the majority of women may own stalls which do not qualify as collateral. Such gender disparities in property holding and acquisition may have to sway our restricted views of what constitutes collateral.

### **What is the Meaning of Gender?**

It does not apply to only women. It refers to the socially structured relations between men and women, among different categories of women and different categories of men. It describes how women relate to each other as mothers, sisters, friends, co-wives, competitors, confidants and how men relate to each other as fathers, patrons, sons, brothers and rivals. This is to be distinguished from sex, which is an immutable characteristic. It also refers to how women and men relate differently to institutions and systems such as the State, educational facilities and political systems.

Gender relations like other forms of relations are structured by ideologies and beliefs, practices, property and resource access, ownership and laws of the State, such as State construction of citizenship. In most jurisdictions, constitutions provide for equality between men and women. This is sometimes negated by other factors such as State gendered ideologies about masculinity and control or where a woman needs the consent of her husband to obtain a passport or credit. In some countries, women who marry foreigners cannot pass on their citizenship to their children whereas men married to foreign women can.

It is important to bear in mind the flexibility of gender relations. They are subject to change with the times and conditions. In Tanzania for example, it is now common for men to dominate the area of food trading. Central to gender analysis is the question of sexual division of labour, which is also subject to change. Some roles may be *gender ascriptive*

because they belong to a particular gender, others are *gender bearing* because of the strong association with specific genders such as women and nursing.

### **The Household, Paid and Unpaid Work and Recognition by the State.**

Domestic activities engaged in by women is an important consideration in any gender analysis. An assumption is made that it is the duty of the woman to carry out certain duties such as attending funerals, hospitals, and visiting relatives in prisons. There are costs associated with these. Elson has shown however that when other people are employed to do this type of work, it is valued. When wives do it however, it is not valued and therefore not taken account of in national income accounting. A gender analysis will remove the boundaries between the private and the public domain and will therefore uncover the real scope of women's work. Anything which could have been paid for will be valued. Another way would be for us to expand our notions of what is work.

While the household is seen as a place of safety and decision-making, in reality however, it is a zone of violence, insecurity and mutual suspicion. It is not uncommon for spouses to for example conceal each other's income from the other. There is also a problem associated with defining the household especially in polygamous situations. This may have practical implications in planning, which proceeds on the assumption that the man is the head of the household at all times whereas in fact marital arrangements may allow for female headship not to forget the growing phenomenon of female headed households due to male migration and current rates of divorce. Such assumptions also overlook the current importance of women as contributors to household incomes.

*Linkages between the micro/meso and macro* is also important in terms of how they interact actively with each other. It is important to bear in mind that institutions may not necessarily be gender-neutral because they are manned by men and women who have been brought up in socially structured ways. Gender perceptions originate from the way we are brought up as children. Many of the negative perceptions have their roots in the different ways boys and girls are taught to relate to each other and the manner in which we are made to perceive one another. See: "Structured Adjustment and African Women Farmers". By Gainesville, University of Florida Press. Also see: Kate Young in her "Gender Planning". The problems that policymakers face are enormous, many of which stem from the fact that they have to respond to political demands. They also have their own ideological positions. The meso level analysis is important to show institutional level influences.

### **How to Operationalise the Research with a Gender Analysis: Some Useful Tips**

- One may use indicators of well being such as per capita income, Gender Development Index, Physical Quality of Life Index, unemployment rates, illiteracy rates and morbidity rates. It can further be disaggregated by other gender sensitive indicators such as and age specific disaggregation. It is however important to focus the analysis not only in terms of what the person has but also in terms of what he or she can do with the particular commodity or facility. An example may be made by comparing levels of female enrolment in schools by drop out rates. Another example may be drawn from the way value added is used as a criteria for the distribution of credit among ITTU's. Using the principle that credit should go to those enterprises which add value to their products, it means automatically that seamstresses and tailors would be left out. On its face, this would appear to be a facially gender neutral policy. But the question which ought to be

asked at this stage is how this disproportionately impacts on women given their limited occupational roles. This may call for an expansion of our own notions of value added.

- The area of decision making is one area in which power relations are brought out. While women may be consulted in the area of water and sanitation, they would invariably be excluded in areas such as energy supply.
- It would also be wrong to assume that all women are equal. A gender analysis would have to examine inter and intra gender inequalities based on for example location such as urban and rural.
- Quality of research may also be affected by a victim's own notion of work. For example, a person who is a maid would not admit that her activities constitute work.
- The manner in which we translate SAP's into policies and policies into concepts such as import liberalisation is important. This may be done according to important landmarks in history.
- It would be important to develop working definitions of all concepts.
- We must be innovative where data does not exist on the pre-adjustment period.
- Most of the research will require quantitative techniques such as focus group discussions. In doing so however, we have to be careful not to put opposing groups (e.g. men and women and older women and younger women) together. Homogenous groups are more likely to generate useful information. It would also be important to establish the purposes of the research and provide a favourable atmosphere for discussions. One has to use sound judgement on the sex of the facilitator and how to reward interviewees for the information.
- *How do we determine the location?* It would depend upon the nature of the topic. If the area of research were mining for instance, one would be looking at specific regions. The scope of secondary data will also help us to make informed choices.
- It would also be important to strategize on how to save time since it is easy to be caught up in local level politics. We also need to see qualitative and quantitative data collection methods as mutually reinforcing.

## **II. PARTICIPATION AS A CITIZENSHIP RIGHT AND A RESEARCH TOOL: THE PARTICIPATORY APPROACHES by Dr. E.Y. Kumfaa, Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology**

Dr. Kumfaa shared his recent experiences/work using participatory approaches as a research tool. He is involved with a 20 country "consultation with the poor" sponsored by the World Bank to provide information for the World Development Report 2000 which focuses on poverty. The project uses an absolutely participatory approach to record what the poor have to say on poverty: what poverty is, how it affects them and how it should be tackled.

In addition, Dr. Kumfaa is also involved in a DFID project using participatory approach to investigate how farmers perceived the project, the tools that were being provided and how they were using them. Finally Dr. Kumfaa, shared some recent discussions that he had had with the guru of participatory approaches - Robert Chambers.

[The following notes are extracted from Chapter 3.....]

### ***Participatory Development 'Paradigm'***

In order to get nearer to lasting development results or sustainability, many agree that a participatory approach has to be taken.

“It will have to begin with the people who know most about their own livelihood systems. In short, it will require the adoption of a new paradigm (J. Pretty and Guijt 1992:23).

Such a paradigm is embodied in a number of projects and activities by which local groups or communities organise themselves with varying degrees of outside support.

The paradigmatic change seems to originate more from development work than from research. The widespread disturbance over poor results despite positive development efforts has brought about the renewed interest in participatory development.

### ***Participation – a Problematic Concept***

The concept of participation is so central in methods for development studies that the applicability of the concept itself requires a critical comment. ‘Participation’ is so widely and so loosely used that the meaning of the concept has become rather blurred. Indeed, the majority of development projects today, incorporate efforts to reach sustainability of project activities through ‘popular’ or ‘local’ participation.

If this has accomplished little but to add ‘participatory strategies’ to the list of failing development strategies, it is timely to ask, if a distinction can be made between genuine participation, and participation as just another formula. I.e. is there an alternative interpretation of participation than the technically inspired, whereby the concept of community participation has been reduced to an administrative problem, a concept concerning a bureaucratic practice?

### ***Empowerment of Efficiency?***

The two major alternative uses of participation centre around participation as an end in itself or as a means to development. They represent ‘transformational participation’ and ‘instrumental participation’. As an end, participation entails empowerment, i.e. everybody’s right to have a say in decisions concerning their own lives. Thus interpreted, participation is an instrument in the promotion of ideological or normative development goals such as social justice, equity and democracy. In the alternative form, participation is interpreted as a means to efficiency in project management – i.e. participation is a tool to implement development policies.

‘Genuine’ participation, initiated and managed by people themselves, is a goal in the democratic process. Thus, Club du Sahel (1988) operates with various degrees of service and voluntary types of participation and degrees of active and passive approaches to promote participation accentuating voluntary and active.

To complete the picture of participatory strategies... it is important to specify who are the people involved – not just the population as such. The strategic parameters have been suggested to involve: (1) the local versus the national level, (2) the State versus the civil society, and (3) the privileged social strata versus the weak and excluded.

Research ... should search for data that relate more specifically to the relationships involved “and should be looking for data concerning the conditions affecting the power relations between specified social groups of the rich and poor” (Lund, S., 1990:182.)

*[For example, a recent study in Ghana asked communities: which institutions did they have control over and why? The answer was interestingly controlled chief, assemblyman, but NOT police, social service providers, and Egos. In particular, the youth complained about their voices not being heard on community projects. The second question was to which institutions do you normally go to when you are in crisis? The reply was first the church or other religious bodies, then the chief, then the police. District assemblies were not mentioned.]*

### **Rapid and Participatory Rural Appraisal – Approaches and Principles**

Ironically, RRA and PRA need not be rural; they need not be appraisal – the A may equally refer to assessment or activity. Nor are they always rapid.

PRA acronyms are widely accepted as the common denominators for a variety of participatory approaches. Many names have been coined by individual practitioners and organisations for the participatory activities in which they engage, - e.g. Rapid Assessment Procedures RAP, Participatory Appraisal and Learning Methods PALM, Participatory Assessment, Monitoring and Education (PAME).

They emphasise a reorientation in the relationship between the outsider and the subjects of development activities and research i.e., a reciprocal learning process in the relationship has replaced the one way ‘transfer of know-how’ idea.

“RRA is mainly extractive. Outsider professionals go to rural areas, obtain information and then bring it away to process and analyse. PRA, in contrast, is participatory. Outsider professionals still go to rural areas, but their role is more to facilitate the collection, presentation and analysis of information by rural people themselves. With RRA the data are owned by the outsiders, and often not shared with the rural people; with PRA they are owned by rural people, but usually shared with outsiders’ (Chambers, R., 1992).

### **Difficulties and Cautions in using Participatory Assessments**

- Use your own best judgement at all times. The methods for creating dialogue and collecting information and rely on ingenuity. If they are done according to a fixed formula, the whole idea of the exercise is jeopardised.
- Please embrace all errors that you or your assistants must have made in the field. You will win the confidence of the community members, and they will be more willing to divulge information to you.
- Completely empty your mind of biases. If you cannot erase your biases, then reverse them. You are going to learn from the people. The results are for the people.
- Team composition is very important. You should try to balance the research teams when they go into the field: Women for women, men for men, group discussions can be either.
- Try as much as possible to let the people talk.

- Appreciate the constraints of your participants. When the participation rate is getting lower or the attrition rate is getting higher, distribute refreshments and distribute or try energising exercises.
- Many communities are over researched and there is research fatigue. But be careful with the use of money to motivate interviewees, but there are creative ways for researchers to show appreciation, and to put the information back in the discussion. You can budget for this in your project proposals, e.g. a scholarship for a girl's secondary education. Working through local organisations to mobilise research and to feed assistance back to a wider beneficiary group. PRA requires you to share information with the community.
- A *focus group* is a collection of people with similar characteristics, which should be differentiated from *simple group discussions*.
- You can use a detailed questionnaire only with *key informants*.
- Be careful of persons who hijack the whole discussion and take you off track.
- Use periods that are relevant in the historical development of the country or the community to map out the memory line.
- Budget for guides and local facilitators.
- How do you draw generalisations from this type of data? Representatives always have partial and not unanimous support. How do researchers separate the opinions about particular people and institutions, if support is not unanimous?
- Filling gaps later is very difficult when you use focus group discussion, because of the open nature of the exercise.

## Questions and Comments

*The definition of participation seems to be so functional that it is hard to get the concept. Participation is democratisation. However, when you elect a representative who does not consult the electorate, and he speaks in Parliament on your behalf, are you participating? What then is the distinction between participation and democracy? Everybody has a right to say something and his voice or her voice to be heard.*

*How were the interviewees selected, since people with issues can self select? We did not handpick people but rather groups of different types of people: men, women, youth, school children etc. We then gathered more elaborate than personal histories.*

In your impact assessment on what has SAP has done to people's lives, choose all groups of people as far as possible including key actors. Use institutional analysis, impact assessment, and focus group discussions.

PRA used for diagnosing and should be preliminary and should not be used for final conclusions/policy making. It is used to form hypotheses and to fill in what is left out by more structured forms of information gathering.

## **Day Three August 13, 1999**

### **(i) SYNTHESIS**

1. Political economy is the overarching framework for the research.
2. Gender Analysis is a spotlight to broaden focus and enrich analysis. The methodology should also be replicated for examining the impact of SAP on other social relations and balances.
3. The Participatory approach is a tool for extracting information, but also should be a principle of how reports are written, how they are discussed and how they are utilised.

### **(ii) Terms of Reference**

## **ANNEX I. TRAINING AND EVALUATION GROUP REPORTS**

### **Political Economy**

#### **Exercise**

Apply political economy approach to the question of “Structural adjustment policies in agriculture and livelihood security”. Consider the following areas:

- (i) historical trends in the importance of agriculture to the national economy;
- (ii) the pricing, marketing, irrigation, export promotion and trade liberalisation policies of the SAP;
- (iii) who are the major actors and beneficiaries of these policies? and
- (iv) what are macro/microeconomic impacts of these policies?

#### **Group 1 Report– Training and Evaluation Exercise (Political Economy)**

(i) Historical perspective - There was not much difference the contribution of agriculture to the national economy between the period before SAP (1970-1983) and after (1984 to present). Agriculture contributes about 60% to GDP, 55% to exports, and 70% to employment.

(ii) Analysis of Policies

#### **Pricing**

- Guaranteed minimum price removed
- Ghana Food Distribution divested
- Narrowed difference between world and producer prices in cocoa while removing subsidy on farm inputs to effect full cost pass-through to farmers.
- Export diversification through the promotion of non-traditional exports using duty drawbacks, price competition, and other incentives. The SAP also encouraged private participation, and resulted in an increase in employment and incomes.

#### **Marketing**

Import and exchange rate liberalisation brought in cheaper imports and resulted in local producers losing their market share.

#### **Export Vs Food Crop Promotion**

- The promotion of export crops resulted in a shift of resources and income away from peasant and small farmers toward commercial farmers.

- The reallocation of land to commercial plantations also created certain frictions in the rural society. Sharecropping systems in export promotion primarily benefit landowners rather than peasant farmers. The recent divestiture of expropriated land originally used for public commercial plantations has basically ignored the restitution of property rights to traditional owners.
- The promotion of sheanut which was traditionally a women-dominated activity resulted in the property rights to the volunteer crops, being reallocated/expropriated by men.
- Can export promotion *engender* food security?
- The balance of land rights and tenure are central to the political economy discussion of the impact of structural adjustment policies in agriculture.

### Irrigation

Irrigation was promoted even before SAP, and resulted in increased employment by ensuring all year production, increased incomes and economic stability for rural areas.

(iii) Principal Actors were Government, World Bank, IMF, and bilateral donors.

### Impact Assessment

- Peasant farmers: lost from removal of subsidies which increased production cost
- Commercial farmers: gained from export promotion partly because they had access to bank loans
- Women farmers: were largely in food crop production and were negatively affected, also by reduction in extension services
- Bureaucrats: there were institutional conflicts and changes in importance because of the promotion of export crops, e.g. cocoa
- World Bank: was kept in business
- Commercial banks: benefited from high interest rates and yields on treasury bills.
- Foreign food exporters: benefited from enlarged market
- Urban consumers: benefited from availability of food, although the prices were high for recently retrenched workers

## **Group 2 Report**

### (i) Definitions

Agriculture - inputs, production activities, outputs

Livelihood - activities to improve standard of living of the people

Analysis of policy by examining impacts in the pre-SAP and SAP periods.

### (ii) Historical importance of agriculture to the economy

- 35-40% GDP
- 60% employment
- export earnings increasing, but in real terms is it significant?

In general, no real difference between pre-SAP and SAP periods.

### (iii) Policies

INPUTS: Removal of subsidies on inputs, focussing on agrochemicals and tools.

*Main actors*: government, private sector, distributors and agents (male or female), peasant and commercial farmers

*In the pre-SAP period, the government was the main suppliers and was incurring costs. Because of budget constraints, there was an unstable supply. Because of pricing farmers were misusing the agrochemicals, including smuggling to neighbouring countries. However, peasant farmers had access to these inputs.*

*During SAP, input supply liberalised and the private sector became actively involved. We need to analyse whether they are making any profit. Is it a predominantly male or female activity? The cost of inputs have risen making them inaccessible to peasant farmers, who have lower productivity and yields and consequently lower food security. Rural-urban migration has increased.*

**OUTPUTS:** Reduction of indirect taxation on cocoa.

*Main actors:* predominantly male, peasant cocoa farmers, Government and COCOBOD

*In the pre- SAP period, government was the main marketing agent and farmers were paid minimal returns.*

*During SAP, there were private buyers, but the price remains government-controlled. However, the farmers are receiving higher returns. How does this translate into higher real income? Many farmers have shifted from cocoa into non-traditional export crops. There was also reduced livelihood security from the retrenchments effected at COCOBOD.*

#### MARKETING

*Main actors:* Government (GFDC, marketing boards), market women, transporters (mainly men), and producers.

*In the pre-SAP period, farmers were suffering because GFDC was buying goods on credit, then expropriating cheques and not repaying farmers. Urban consumers were also suffering from poor food supply and subsequent high costs. Were the middlemen benefiting?*

*During SAP, the urban consumer continues to suffer because of the move to export crops, away of from food crops. The rural producer is also suffering and again, the middlemen are benefiting from offering exorbitant credit tied to input supplies.*

#### EXPORT PROMOTION Vs FOOD CROP PRODUCTION

The increase emphasis on non-traditional products has caused domestic food crop supply to decrease.

### **Group 3 Report– Training and Evaluation Exercise (Political Economy)**

#### (i) Contribution of agriculture to the national economy

- 55% GDP in the past now 39-40% showing a decline
- 39-40% of exports including cocoa. Cocoa declining and non-traditional exports increasing.
- 65% of total employed, but many part-time.

#### (ii) Main Actors

This listing includes both known actors and other actors whose actual participation and influence in policymaking needs to be investigated.

- Government, comprising but not limited to MOF, MOFA, MOT, Council of Regional Secretaries/Ministers, CEPS, GEPC, Prices and Incomes Board, Agricultural Development Bank, Bank of Ghana.
- World Bank, IMF, bilateral donors
- National Farmers Council (Cocoa, Sheanut and Coffee Farmers; Ghana National Association of Farmers and Fishermen), GRPTU, GAWU.

(iii) Policies and beneficiaries

SAP	Winners	Losers
<b>PRICING</b>		
eliminated of price controls	price controls never really implemented, so no winners or losers	
removed input subsidies		farmers, extension service foreign exporter of inputs to Ghana government/COCOBOD
reduced cocoa tax	Farmers	
<b>MARKETING POLICIES</b>		
private participation in cocoa marketing	private companies, farmers receive higher prices and benefits from companies, rural dwellers hired as buying agents	PBC
commercialised GFDC	government gained from not have to finance GFDC	bureaucrats who were hoarding produce, retrenched workers
<b>EXPORT Vs FOOD CROP PROMOTION</b>		
introduced export tax rebates	exporters, government increased exchange earnings, unemployed from job creation	government from lost revenue
liberalised exchange rate promotion of non-traditional agricultural exports	<i>this was too complex to discuss in the time</i> farmers, exporters, transporters, unemployed through job creation	domestic food crop consumers lost as food crop supply fell and prices rose
<b>IRRIGATION POLICIES</b>		
move to small and medium sized dams - transferred management to communities	government, communities who gained from more reliable supply	bureaucrats who use to allocate prime land to themselves.
<b>TRADE LIBERALIZATION</b>		
lowered tariffs on agric inputs	Farmers Importers	domestic producers of agricultural inputs
lower tariffs on agric products	urban dwellers from lower (imported) food prices	farmers domestic food producers

liberalisation of importation	of Importers and unemployed from job creation	bureaucrats, who used to benefit from restricting the supply of inputs
distribution of inputs	banks who reduced agricultural lending to gain credit from high treasury bill rates	farmers, who lost access to credit
credit liberalisation		

(iv) Macroeconomic impacts can be analysed in five areas -equity, stability, independence/self sufficiency, efficiency/resource allocation, and resource conservation/environmental concerns.

### Questions and comments

*Where can we place the best farmer award? Are there still incentives for small farmers to increase productivity and performance or are all the benefits skewed toward large commercial farming? From the political economy approach, SAP seems to benefit only one class of farmer.* Note the response of the political leadership to Farmers Day versus May Day. Previously workers were the major supporters of the regime when it came to power. But after the introduction of SAP, workers turned against the leadership. Hence the creation of Farmer's Day, which until recently completely superseded May Day.

*Do we always want to have peasant farmers?* Every country has an optimal distribution of size of farms, just as in industries with small and larger businesses. The issue here is to give access to productivity improving information/incentives/inputs to all sizes of farmers.

### ANNEX 2:

#### TRAINING AND EVALUATION GROUP REPORTS - A COMBINATION OF THE GENDER AND PARTICIPATORY APPROACHES

*In this session, researchers were permitted to group themselves according to their respective research areas. The question revolved around examining the issues, institutions, trend analysis and impact analysis of the four research components.*

#### Group 1 Report - Mining & Environment

##### Topical areas

Historical aspects of mineral production, marketing, and pricing

Mining and dislocated community life

- corporate responsibilities
- resettlement and relocation, compensation packages
- environmental issues
- gender issues
- trading
- food supply
- break-up of families
- relation between expatriates and young girls, prostitution and aids

cost-benefit of foreign investment in mining

- incentives offered by state to investments
- structure and pattern of new investments
- balance between expatriates and local investors
- pattern of distribution, small, medium and large mines
- resources brought into the country by foreign investors,
- resources consumed by mining investment including capital flight,
- employment and remuneration to expatriates and locals
- staff training and labour issues
- subcontracting phenomenon of investment activities,
- linkages with other sectors of the economy
- extent of value added to products mined
- profit repatriation

environment

- medicinal plants, fuel, wood being lost

employment and education patterns

- impacts on women
- education impacts, 3rd level women and 2nd level scholarship schemes
- young girls and boys going to school
- more private and government owned schools around main mining centres

### **Institutions to be investigated**

EPA, MC, MD, GSD, Chamber of Mines, DAs, District Environment Management Committees, WACA

### **Subject areas for trend analysis**

mineral production and value

health

trading

environment and land fertility

foreign exchange earnings and consumption

income levels

### **Impact analysis**

environment, health and linkages

### **Questions and comments**

1. *Do not fall into the easy trap of paying lip service to gender issues. Investigation of contribution of children and women in processing of minerals would be important.*
2. *You have emphasised the environmental effects of large-scale mines, but what of health/environmental effects of small-scale processing? For example, by quantifying the land laid to waste by smaller mines.*
3. *The participatory approach may be used to finding out communities' own valuation of environmental/health costs versus economic benefits.*

4. *In using PRA or other research techniques to obtain information re expatriate investor's practices, it will be important to present a neutral front rather than reveal any opposition to them, carrying out a cost-benefit analysis of their involvement.*
5. *The negative impacts of resettlement schemes have been widely studied. A new exercise may be to use PRA to consider the social impact coming out of these schemes.*
6. *The traditional chiefs should be mentioned in list of institutions/actors especially for their role in the allocation of land.*
7. *While the employment of expatriates is a drop in a bucket, it is important to consider the spill-over/ripple effect of increased employment of locals at all levels in mining industry.*

**Group 2 Report - Agriculture**

<b>Policies and Questions</b>	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Subjects</b>
PRICING -Elimination of price controls <i>Trends:</i> prices of inputs and outputs  -Import Subsidy Removals  -Reduction of Indirect Cocoa Tax <i>Trends:</i> private participation	GFDC, GNAFF, MOFA, COCOBOD, District Assemblies, NGOs, Commercial and development Banks, ADB, GCB,	Farmers: disaggregated by age: youth gender: location: rural, urban, peri-urban associations and co-operatives size: small, medium, large peasant/commercial individuals versus groups: associations, commodity associations, co-operatives commodities ecological zones

<p><b>MARKETING</b>          -Private competition in domestic cocoa marketing          -Commercialisation of GFDC</p>	<p>GFDC, PBC and LBCs, COCOBOD</p>	<p>Cocoa farmers disaggregated by</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• regional differences</li> <li>• size</li> <li>• individuals/coops</li> <li>• gender</li> </ul>
<p><b>TRADE POLICY</b>          -Tax rebates for exports          -Liberalisation of exchange rate          -Promotion of non-traditional agric. Exports  <i>Trends:</i> Production volume          Export volume          Exchange earnings &amp; use          No. individual exporters</p>	<p>MOT, GEPC, Bank of Ghana, CEPS, IRS</p>	<p>export associations          individual exporters          non-traditional crop producers by</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• gender,</li> <li>• location e.g. distance from port,</li> <li>• various commodities exported</li> </ul> <p>transporters          importers of agriculture inputs and products</p>
<p><b>TRADE LIBERALIZATION</b>          -Lower tariffs for agric imports inputs and products  <i>Trends:</i> Volume of imports          Number of importers            -Liberalisation of imports and distribution of agric inputs  <i>Trends:</i> volume of credit          interest rate          coverage of credit recipients          disaggregated by gender, age, etc.</p>	<p>CEPS, MOT, MOFA, Private companies, (FASCOMS), Ghana Animal Science Association</p>	<p>Livestock associations          Feed mills          Farmers disaggregated by gender, association location, commercial/peasant          input distributors          importers          banks</p>
<p><b>IRRIGATION</b>          Shifts in irrigation management from government to community  <i>Trends:</i> acreage under cultivation</p>	<p>Ghana Irrigation Development Association, IFAD representatives</p>	<p>Farmers disaggregated by</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• individual/group</li> <li>• gender</li> <li>• age</li> <li>• participant vrs non-participants</li> <li>• community leaders</li> </ul>

**Impact analysis**

macro discussed yesterday. meso, micro - acreage yields, size of farms, production, returns, h/h expenditure

**Method**

before-and-after

## Questions and Comments

1. *Is Ghana saving on the importation of rice versus the domestic production of rice? In the pre-SAP - import were controlled through strict allocation of foreign exchange and an import priority list. These measures are prohibited because Ghana is a signatory to WTO.*
2. *Both urban and rural consumers should be included as major subjects/actors. The research should not concentrate wholly on the production side of agriculture but also on domestic consumption. The trend analysis should include inflation, and the significance of agricultural production over time to average price levels. It should also look at changes in expenditure patterns across categories of goods (food, housing, etc) as an impact of SAP through agriculture on the average consumer.*
3. *What about urban farming?*
4. *The research should consider the effect of SAP on agricultural training institutions.*

## Group 3 Report – Health Services

### **Types of services**

Orthodox (public and private)

Traditional

- spiritualist
- herbalists
- TBA's
- acupuncture

### **Topic Areas**

coverage and quality of care

### **Justification**

geographical areas

pre-SAP health services were concentrated at centralised points

post-SAP health services are decentralised, DHMT strengthened to implement policy of SA to expand centres and posts

financial aspect

pre-SAP budget was centralised

post -SAP budget was decentralised, Budget Management Committees in every district.

financial accessibility

woman are the focus at the rural level, costs were introduced with decentralisation

differential access, intra and interregional, rural and urban areas

h/h resource reallocation due to cost recovery in social services

quality of care

access to services

appropriate method mix

continuity of use  
counselling and informed choice  
good interpersonal communications  
technical competence

### **Institutions**

MOH, donor community, health providers, private hospitals, women, youth, community based organisations, health policy makers, regional councils

### **Trend analysis**

attendance's, death rates, admission rates (by gender)

### **Questions, Comments and Suggested Considerations**

1. *What happened to the goal of Health for all by the year 2000, which was initiated in Ghana from 1979?*
2. *Is there training capacity to supply distribution of health services? The intake of training institutions has increased, but problems still remain with filling posts in disadvantaged areas. In addition, many specialists after receiving training have migrated overseas. Salary and remuneration rather than training capacity remains an important constraint to filling posts*
3. *The report should include some consideration of preventative as well as curative services. In fact the pre SAP emphasis in health service delivery was on curative services, while during SAP emphasis has shifted to preventative.*
4. *How are needs assessments for cash and carry system being done? Are the appropriate disadvantages groups, e.g. old age and disabled receiving free payment? The process and assignment of exemptions from the cash and carry system are currently being reviewed.*
5. *Will the research address the proliferation of herbal preparations rather than just supply of herbal services? Although this is a growing concern in the health sector administration, it may not be attributable to SAP.*
6. *What about health insurance? Health insurance is still being debated in Ghana. One district is experimenting with it.*
7. *Trend analysis should consider infant mortality rates (which have been reduced), bed states, resource allocation to health services.*
8. *How real is the decentralisation of health service management especially with respect to controls over financing and internally generated funds?*
9. **WARNING:** *Be careful not to attribute every single health concern to SAPs*

## **Group 4 Report - Micro impacts on employment and urban poverty**

before and after

pre-SAP

### **SAP policies**

Trade liberalisation of imports and exchange rate

Privatisation

Domestic price deregulation

Export diversification

### **Issues**

Employment (to be defined)

sources: government/private sector - formal/informal

sectors: agriculture, industry, services

data: numbers of people employed by sectors over the period

gender disaggregation

### **Manufacturing**

Institutions: MOTI, PEF, AGI, NBSSI, manufacturing firms and associations GAWE, ASSI, MESW, GSS, Registrar General, Banks, micro-enterprises, self-employed, credit providing institutions

Issues: extent of consultations on policy or participation through representatives

### **Management and Unions**

Institutions: industry associations,

Key informants: research institutions, MOTI, MESW, experts on Ghana economy

Labour Force; age, size, gender, participation rate, distribution by types and skills

Firms: size, level of employment, product types, and technology

## **ANNEX III: RESULTS OF DISCUSSION OF TIME FRAME FOR RESEARCH**

### **Principles:**

- ◆ Not to extend the research too far into the year 2000 since it is an election year. An extended period may either jeopardise or compromise the research results. Time is therefore of the essence.
- ◆ The Literature Review should not be seen as comprehensive review since many reviews have been carried out in the past. It should rather be seen as an exercise of co-operation or an exercise in collaborative research.
- ◆ Researchers will be used as SAPRI resource persons in the long term as for example in the current proposal by the World Bank to seek the views of CivisoC on the CAS.
- ◆ The Assignment should be seen as a national exercise.
- ◆ Group dynamics will be sorted out by the groups themselves. Contact numbers and addresses will be distributed in due course.
- ◆ Groups with less numbers may make use of research assistants from a list provided by the secretariat.
- ◆ Success of work will also be based upon timely release of logistics. The secretariat would therefore have to do its best to ensure proper co-ordination and prompt response to needs.

## **IMPORTANT DATES:**

### **The research will take 14 weeks instead of 10.**

- ❑ Three weeks will be devoted to the literature review
- ❑ Eight weeks will be devoted to field research
- ❑ Three weeks will be devoted to report writing

### **Submissions**

- ❑ The literature review will be due on September 6<sup>th</sup> 1999
- ❑ Researchers will be expected to submit their proposals by September 10<sup>th</sup> 1999
- ❑ The Draft Report which consists of a preliminary document for the outreach should reach the secretariat by November 5<sup>th</sup> 1999.
- ❑ The final report should be submitted by November 30<sup>th</sup> although the final dead line could be extended to the first week of January 1999.

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### **Tripartite Technical Committee Members**

Dr. Evelyn Awittor	-	Health Economist, World Bank (Chair)
Ms. Camille Lampart	-	Resident Country Economist, World Bank
Dr. Emmanuel Akwetey	-	SAPRI Co-ordinator
Prof. Kwesi Jonah	-	Lecturer, University of Ghana, Legon
Dr. Kwabia Boateng	-	Lecturer University of Ghana, Legon
Dr. W.A. Alhassan	-	Director, Research Division, Ministry of Finance (absent)
Mr. George Cann	-	Director of Planning, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Devebptment (absent)

### **CivisoC Council and Management Team Representative**

Judith Thompson

### **Researchers**

1. Dr. Ralph Asabere
2. Sebastian Avle
3. Dr. Romanus Dinye
4. John Setuni Achuliwor
5. Samuel Akuamoah Boateng
6. Dr. Gyiele Nurah
7. Richard Afenu
8. Godwin Dogbey
9. C.F.A. Nyaaba
10. Francis Ekey

### **SAPRI Secretariat :**

Mrs. Beatrice Duncan  
Betty Maafo  
Pauline Vande - Pallen