

# **THE SECOND NATIONAL SAPRI FORUM**

**ACCRA, MAY 7-6, 2001**

## **DRAFT REPORT OF THE RAPPORTEUR GENERAL**

**Prepared by**

**Rapporteur General: A. Denkabi**

**With**

**Rapporteurs: Akua Britum**

**Abdul N. Issahaku**

**Theophilus Richardson**

**Kwesi Jonah**

**Ferdinand D. Tay**

## **1. O. OPENING**

### **1.1. Welcome and Introduction**

The opening session of the SAPRI Second National Forum began with Dr Emmanuel Akwetey, SAPRI Liaison Officer, welcoming participants to the final public phase nationally of SAPRI launched 4 years earlier in November 1997.

He also acknowledged the presence of a number of invited guests and distinguished personalities. He expressed appreciation for their making time to be at the forum at a short notice.

He pointed out that the group that had gathered for the Forum consisted of the widest representation possible of civil society, Government and World Bank officials. The group was made up mainly of members of CIVISOC drawn from the 10 regions of the country through a process of regional forums and election of delegates. Other participants at the SAPRI National forum included Government and World Bank officials, Members of Parliament, the general public as well as representatives of specific civil society groups not involved in the regional selection process.

The SAPRI Liaison Officer said further that the second Forum was the result of the first one, held in November, 1998, at which delegates agreed on a number of broad areas – agriculture, trade, mining, health and education – in which research would be done in order to determine the impact of Structural Adjustment, the lessons that may be learnt and the proposals that could be made for the way forward. The forum was to reconvene after the completion of the research and participants were therefore gathered to discuss 4 of these reports, as agriculture had not been covered in the research.

He concluded by introducing the Chair for the Forum, Professor Akilagpa Sawyerr, independent Chair of the Tripartite National Steering Committee (TNSC) of the SAPRI process.

### **1.2 Introductory Remarks**

In his introductory remarks, Professor Sawyerr stressed the importance of the contribution of a wide spectrum of people in the evaluation of Structural

Adjustment, hence his pleasure in welcoming the gathering. He expressed the hope that all would remain throughout the duration of the Forum and take active part in the deliberations. In his view, the degree of participation would determine the value of the final product, as the SAP review was not anymore simply a technical affair.

He went on to give some sense of the process undergone since the launch of the SAPRI initiative. The process had started with the setting up of the tripartite national steering committee and a range of other bodies under this committee charged with carrying forward the work. The idea was that evaluation of SAPRI experience would be conducted by a combination of civil society representatives, Government and the World Bank. The ideal set by the Tripartite National Committee for the SAP review was that it should be a process whose outcome reflected the thinking of all participants in the review process. He lamented that this ideal was not always met though there was ample opportunity for participation from all stakeholders. He however pointed out that an important fallout of the process had been the emergence of an organised leadership for civil society regarding the creation of an awareness among a range of bodies that policy making is no longer the preserve of bureaucrats and politicians.

According to Professor Sawyerr the real work in this process had been to produce research, which was an evaluation of the impact of SAP on the country's economy and society. He was now able to bring to the Forum the results of the work. He added that because of the failure of one of the teams commissioned to do the research, there was not going to be a report on the agricultural sector – a matter of great regret for members of the Committee.

He concluded by acknowledging support received from a variety of sources. He singled out the Canadian High Commission for the mission's strong funding support for the CIVISOC aspect of the SAPRI process. Other acknowledgements went to the Government of Ghana, the World Bank in Washington, the World Bank office in Accra and SAPRIN, the global network with oversight responsibility for the work of SAPRI in all countries.

## **2.0 OPENING STATEMENTS**

### **2.1 Global Overview of SAPRI – Douglas Hellinger, SAPRI Secretariat, Washington DC**

Mr Douglas Hellinger of the SAPRI Secretariat, Washington, DC, spoke next on 'A Global Overview of SAPRI'. He expressed his gratitude for the opportunity to address the gathering. He also thanked Third World Network, which, he said, organised and assisted all the African SAPRI processes as the regional centre for Africa.

He noted that what had taken place with SAP fell very much within a global context. SAPRI was therefore devised to have a global focus and Ghana featured in this as one of the countries from which people would learn and apply the lessons to a global learning for the World Bank and other parties.

Mr Hellinger pointed out that a generation of SAP policies had already come to pass mainly because of the need to adjust which countries were facing, the new schools of thought that had come into being, the political issue of using economics as a means of control and the need on the part of corporations for access to markets. He characterised the cumulative global effect of SAP as a mixed one.

According to Mr Hellinger, SAPRI started with a number of groups believing that SAPS were wrong, unjust and not working; that people understood their own experience even in the area of macroeconomics and deserved the chance to apply this knowledge. This was the challenge that Mr Wolfenson had risen to as the new head of the World Bank by asking for a mechanism for learning about structural adjustment. It had been felt that mobilisation was important and that was what had happened in one country after the other, providing a mechanism for learning about people's experience and analysis of structural adjustment programs.

He expressed his gratitude to those he described as the major funders of this worldwide exercise. These included the governments of Norway, Sweden, Belgium, Holland as well as the European Union, United Nations and NGOs.

He observed in closing that twenty years of a particular body of policy had passed and it was time to re-evaluate. The challenge was to throw out what did not work and start anew.

## **2.2 SAPRI in Ghana**

### **2.2.1 Mr Kwesi Adu-Amankwah, T.U.C. Secretary General, Chairman of CIVISOC**

Mr Kwesi Adu-Amankwah, speaking in his capacity as chairman of CIVISOC, said that 4 years of active collaboration between the World Bank, CIVISOC, Government and NGOs within the framework of SAPRI had demonstrated new and real possibilities for changing the character and process of economic and social policy decision making towards inclusion and participation.

He gave an account of SAPRI process in Ghana stressing that the CIVISOC aspect of the process had constituted the broadest coalition yet of civil society in Ghana, bringing together, as it had, representatives of business, labour, the student movement, religious bodies and NGOs.

He drew a number of lessons from the SAPRI process in Ghana. The first was that the work of CIVISOC had brought out capacity weakness as an important limitation on the ability of people to engage adequately in policy dialogue. The response to this had consisted of efforts to promote economic literacy among organisations and activists of civil society through workshops on international financial institutions and their operations and the process of national budget making.

The second lesson according to Mr. Adu- Amankwah, was that SAPRI and the existence of CIVISOC had also provided a vehicle for co-ordinating broad consultation with civil society. Both the World Bank and the Government had utilised this kind of input from civil society.

Mr. Adu-Amankwah also remarked that the foregoing lessons continued to pose the important question of social investment in democratic participation. He explained that for CIVISOC participation to be effective and meaningful the organisations that represented it had to be encouraged and strengthened. Apart from the self-help that CIVISOC needed to do in this direction, he thought Government and the World Bank had a responsibility to invest in democratic participation.

Concluding, Mr Adu-Amankwah acknowledged the consistent support received from CIDA, UNDP, the World Bank and the Government of Ghana. He also expressed appreciation for the wise leadership of the independent Chairman of the Tripartite National Steering Committee as well as the dedicated service of personnel of the SAPRI secretariat and saluted the memory of the late Judith Thompson, a member of the management team of CIVISOC and Executive Director of PRONET who died in a plane crash in June 2000.

### **2.2.2 Dr G.A. Agambila, Representative of Minister of Finance**

Dr G.A. Agambila spoke next on behalf of the Minister of Finance. He extended to the Forum the Minister's warm greetings and best wishes as well as his regrets for his inability to participate in the forum due to urgent matters he had to attend to.

He referred to the circumstances in which government endorsed the country's participation in SAPRI. He said that Government recognised the need for a more systematic and comprehensive approach to the adverse impacts of SAP and perceived SAPRI positively as a process that could generate empirical information to guide the design of new policies.

Government, since the launch of SAPRI, had demonstrated its commitment to the exercise through sponsorship of major SAPRI events, appointment of representatives to serve on the National Tripartite Steering Committee and the technical advisory committee and close collaborative work with representatives of CIVISOC and the World Bank Ghana office.

He pointed out that in the course of implementing SAPRI, the government and civil society organizations had had the opportunity of working closely together and of ultimately improving their relations from hostility and confrontation to better knowledge of each other and knowledge of how to work together better. This he said was shown in the preparation of the country's Poverty Reduction strategy.

He gave the assurance that the government would abide by the provisions of the 1992 constitution which recognized the strategic role of civil society organizations in the formulation and execution of national development plans.

He identified the challenge ahead as one that required that the progress achieved through SAPRI be consolidated to serve the needs of future relations. He concluded by conveying the appreciation of the Government of Ghana to all who had worked tirelessly to make SAPRI in Ghana successful and wished the Forum fruitful deliberations.

### **2.2.3 Mr. Peter Harold, Country Director, World Bank**

Mr. Harold expressed his pleasure that the 2<sup>nd</sup> National Forum was actually taking place. He saw the great attendance and large representation as a measure of the success of the SAPRI initiative.

Another measure for him was the fact that one could go to remote regions as he had done and find people wanting to know about such current policy issues as HIPC. This could only have happened because of the channels of communication created by SAPRI.

He posed more directly the question whether SAPRI had succeeded. He considered the mandate of SAPRI fulfilled. The research had been largely done and in a participatory way and there had been genuine collaboration devoid of confrontation, entrenched positions and resistance. CIVISOC had also been created and a permanent coalescing of civil forces had taken place. This, in his view, had significance for the future of the country.

SAPRI, in his opinion, had also led to certain changes in ways of doing things. In the preparation of the Bank's country assistance strategy, CIVISOC and its regional fora had been consulted on what the country assistance needed to be doing. He spoke of the overwhelming demand for input into resource allocation and finance management issues from civil society and said that this was to be supported in partnership with the Ministry of Finance.

He noted how some consultation always raised the need for more and suggested that a challenge that would have to be met would be that of deepening consultation all the way down.

He thought that the Bank's openness had changed especially in terms of accessibility particularly for information. He then raised some of the important sectoral questions that the Forum could discuss. Had trade liberalization given manufacturing industry time to adapt? Who had been the beneficiaries of that liberalization? Was the development in mining

worth it in spite of the increase in output? If local communities did not benefit what could be done? Had the reforms in tertiary education increased access but lowered quality? What was to be done then? As regards the exemptions policy, it was not exactly a question of no cost recovery but rather that of how the poor could be protected. He expressed the hope that an important outcome would be some positions on how the parties could work together to continue to improve the formulation of social and economic policy in Ghana.

### **2.3 KEYNOTE ADDRESS: For H.E. President J. A. Kufuor**

The keynote address was delivered on behalf of H.E. President J.A. Kufour by Dr. Kwesi Nduom, Minister for Economic Planning and Regional Integration, on the theme of moving forward from economic decline and structural adjustment to wealth creation, poverty reduction and prosperity for all.

The speaker noted the relationship between the forum and the National Economic Dialogue that was scheduled to take place the following week. Whilst one closed a chapter the other, in his view, opened a new one.

He observed that the review of the impact of macro-economic policies of the past began long before the launching of SAPRI and was quite central to the debates in the recent electioneering campaign leading to the December 2000 elections.

He pointed out that after 20 years of implementing structural adjustment programmes with generally poor results, it was proper to reflect on the past and to draw lessons to inform the choices that needed to be made.

He emphasized the government's commitment to prudent, competent and sound management of the economy and explained the actions taken so far in that direction.

He said that government had listened to calls for participation of citizens in the formulation of macro-economic policies and had responded by inviting civil society organisations and others to join in debating the broad range of public policy issues at the National Economic Dialogue.

He concluded by putting a number of broad questions which he charged participants to submit proposals on for the way forward at the end of the forum: how could the country move forward from the flaws of SAP and the challenge of SAPRI to establish a new era of creating wealth, reducing poverty and ensuring prosperity for all citizens? How could the populace establish a formal system of citizens' participation in economic policymaking for a new era of sound economic governance and high levels of foreign private investments in support of the aspiration of being a rich middle-income country?

### **3.0 REPORT OF SYNDICATE GROUP ON EDUCATION**

**Chairperson: Dr. Bortei-Doku-Aryeetey.**

**Presenters: W. Boateng and A. Akinyoade.**

**Discussant: Hon. Dr. M. Ibn Chambas.**

**Rapporteur: Akua Britwum.**

In her opening remarks, the Chairperson expressed her pleasure for the invitation to chair the syndicate session and be part of a process to review macro economic development policy.

She expressed the hope that the discussions would address the following questions:

1. What happened to Education under SAP?
2. What were the antecedents to SAP and what results did they produce on Education under SAP?
3. How do we shape future policy to avoid the pitfalls of the past?

However before the session could proceed a participant objected to the absence of the present Minister of Education, noting the importance of the discussions for policy direction as well as the presence of the past deputy minister of Education, a factor that the participant thought could help promote continuity.

Reactions indicated that the Minister was aware of the present session and had expressed the desire to be present. His absence, it was thought, suggested that something held him up. The Executive Secretary for Tertiary Education explained that the Minister would certainly be with the group. The Minister did join the group later.

#### **3.1 Research Report on Education.**

The presenters began by explaining that the study focused exclusively on Tertiary education.

They went on to outline the problem that the research investigated. Ghana launched a series of reform initiatives in 1983 with the Economic Recovery Programme (ERP) and followed this up with Structural Adjustment

Programme (SAP) in 1986. The result was a substantial increase in governmental and donor funding to all sectors of the Ghanaian economy.

The expectation that improvements in the economy would lead to increased access to and better quality of education in Ghana had not been realised. Educational institutions therefore continue to have difficulty developing the required type of human capital for the country's socio-economic and political development.

According to the presenters, studies on the education sector with a bearing on policy direction existed in significant numbers. These tended, however, to be, more often than not, work commissioned by external agencies and also work that addressed problems of education at the basic and secondary levels. Very little attention was being paid to investigating problems at the tertiary education level in Ghana.

The present study attempted to bridge this gap by reviewing, systematically, existing literature on tertiary education and by surveying views and opinions of stakeholders of tertiary education under SAP.

### **3.1.1 Study Objectives**

The main aim of the study, according to the presenters, was to assess the impact of SAP on access to and quality of tertiary education in Ghana. Specific objectives included;

- assess content focus, sponsors and major findings of studies on tertiary education between 1983 and 1999 in Ghana.
- assess extent of gender equity in terms of student enrolment.
- investigate tertiary institutions' policy on access and quality assurance.
- examine views of tertiary institution authorities, students and parents on funding and cost recovery.
- collect views and concerns of stakeholders about the impact of SAP on tertiary education and
- give stakeholders the opportunity to make recommendations for a sustainable tertiary education system in Ghana.

### **3.1.2 Methodology**

This consisted of three main methods:

1. Literature review, which covered Government official statistics, documents and reports, World Bank/IMF studies and reports on education and SAP and other sources.
2. Survey that involved an interview of individuals from all institutions/organisations with a stake in tertiary education.
3. Focus group discussions that involved parents, opinion leaders and assembly members.

The study covered all public universities. It also included polytechnic institutions in towns where universities were located, as well as Takoradi Polytechnic.

### **3.1.3 Main Findings**

1. Research into education in Ghana continued to be mainly donor driven. Ministry of Education (MOE) had commissioned very few studies.
2. Ghana's education system before SAP was in near collapse and was dysfunctional in relation to the goals and aspirations of the country.
3. The introduction of SAP was to address public sector management, and rehabilitate educational system.
4. World Bank emphasis was on reducing tertiary education share of education budget to 18%.
5. Implementation of SAP caused a squeeze on education financing and reduced drastically government expenditure to education in the period 1983 – 1999.
6. The goal of tertiary education reforms was to enhance cost-effectiveness and make system sustainable and improve access and quality of education.
7. The conditions for sustainable quality improvement were still absent.
8. Access had improved in terms of the establishment of more tertiary institutions.
9. Female enrolment still continued to lag behind that of males.
10. Special education reflected a share of the overall constraints in the whole education sector.
11. Factors like lack of adequate funding, human and material resources and poor supervision had constrained the total implementation of the reforms.

12. Despite the fact that tertiary institutions were positively disposed to Distance Education, very little had been done by the universities themselves in terms of promoting it.
13. Factors like lack of facilities/logistics, inadequate funding, and lack of staff motivation had impacted negatively on the quality of tertiary education.
14. Most institutions had introduced market driven courses in response to the needs of industry but effective running of these courses was constrained by the general problems of the universities.
15. The introduction of SAP reforms had strengthened the dominant mechanisms for the quality control of teaching staff.
16. Factors affecting fund mobilisation of institutions included delay in release of subvention, inadequacy of government subvention and delays in fee payment.
17. SAP reforms had shifted the burden of financing students to the SSNIT loan scheme, parents and the students themselves.
18. The main component of cost recovery was fees paid by the students.
19. SAP educational reforms had improved access to tertiary education, student's loan and the provisioning of library facilities.

### **3.1.4 Recommendations**

1. There was the need to address the availability of funding and human resources to enhance implementation of tertiary reforms.
2. MOE needed to initiate and conduct more research.
3. Access to tertiary education needed to be backed by improvement in the quality of education.
4. More resources ought to be devoted to establishing and running Distance Education programmes.
5. More efforts ought to be devoted by tertiary institutions to the generation of funds through activities like research and consultancies.
6. The SSNIT loan scheme needed to be strengthened to make it more sustainable.
7. Parent's ability to pay for tertiary education ought to feed into any package on the implementation of cost sharing.
8. Tertiary institutions needed to review curricula to make their courses more practical oriented and more rewarding to the client (student and public and private sector).
9. The following sources of funding ought to be considered:
  - Community sponsorship of students and bonding to have them return to work for the community;

- Sponsorship of needy students by organisations that benefited in the main from tertiary education.
- Workers pay 1% of monthly salaries towards a special educational levy.
- Industry sponsorship for students pursuing courses in their related fields of work.

### **3.2 Discussant's Intervention**

The discussant began by reminding the group of the importance of the goal of SAPRI, the opportunity it offered for civil society groups to review together with experts and policy makers the impact of SAP. For him the importance of SAPRI was underscored by the fact that the problems that SAP was supposed to address still remained two decades after implementation. The discussant also acknowledged the difficulties policy makers faced when their well thought out programmes faced rejection by the very people they were supposed to benefit.

The discussant also noted that the discussion on tertiary education had added importance because the first phase of the Tertiary Education Project (TEP 1) had just ended and Ghana was in the process of beginning the design and operationalisation of the second phase (TEP 2).

He outlined again the goals of SAP in tertiary education as being basically to:

- Increase access, improve quality and relevance of education to national needs
- Address equity issues in relation to gender, rural/urban and regional balance in terms of access to tertiary education and,
- Improve the coordination and management of tertiary institutions as well as institute measures for cost sharing as an additional source of funding.

He agreed with the research findings on the state of the tertiary education before SAP as well as the need to initiate more research into education locally. He however lamented the small size of respondents especially for focus group discussions (FGD) and the lack of effort by the researchers to look at the tertiary education sector as part of an integrated whole.

The discussant concluded by raising the following questions:

- How was the decline in government funding for education to be reversed?
- Why had the country allowed the proportion of GDP allocated to education to decline?
- How would the country find other means for financing tertiary education?
- How could the country make other sources for financing education currently available accessible to those who really needed them? He made specific reference to educational funds initiated by the various traditional councils and noted how they tended to be urban based and therefore had the tendency to favour urban residents.
- How to set up a student loan scheme that was sustainable and addressed the issue that support should reach needy students alone and not all students in tertiary institutions?
- How to realise the potential that distance education had to offer in increasing access?
- Which strategy was best and what mix would be correct to adopt; a first rate educational system, available to a few members of society or the reverse?

### **3.3 Minister of Education's intervention**

The Minister also noted the importance of the review stressing that it was a process that would help strengthen the successes and help highlight the shortcomings. He went on to emphasise the need for the group to consider TEP 2 as the context within which the discussions on tertiary education should be centred. He pointed out some shortcomings in the implementation of the tertiary education reforms; in particular the failure of policy makers to take account of the infrastructure needs that increased enrolment would pose in terms of the demand for accommodation, lecture halls and equipment. He did assure the group that he was planning to address the infrastructure needs of tertiary institutions once the modalities for accessing and utilising monies from the Education Trust Fund were put in place. He also mentioned that his Ministry was making attempts to commission research into problem areas that the sector faced as well as set up an advisory board for distance education.

He also outlined challenges facing the sector as:

- The need to develop a new approach to educational policy formulation that saw the sector as one whole and not a sector made up of disjointed levels.
- A fresh approach to polytechnics that took as priority the expansion of old institutions in addition to the opening of new ones.
- Measures to strengthen the national economy as a way of ensuring that national resources that were made available to the education sector would be adequate to meet needs. He made specific reference to the HIPC initiative and asked that the implications its implementation would have for tertiary education for example be examined.
- He suggested the development of programmes that would attack poverty and enhance the individual's ability to access education

### **3.4 Group Discussions**

The Chair set the tone for the group by explaining the purpose for the gathering and raising questions that the discussions ought to address. The questions she raised were:

- How much of the present situation could be attributed to SAP? What were the antecedents to SAP and what were their outcomes in terms of their impact on tertiary education?
- How may future policies be shaped in order to avoid the pitfalls of the past?

Discussions in the syndicate group covered the entire education sector and were not limited to tertiary education alone. The discussions in the main raised concerns about situations that were undesirable in the education sector and went forward to offer suggestions for addressing the concerns that were raised. The concerns raised covered issues like what gaps the research on education had, the quality of education generally, the staff operating within the sector as well as the tertiary education policy making process. Funding the education sector generally and tertiary education specifically generated a lot of debate. Other issues discussed were equity in access to tertiary education, private participation in providing tertiary education, the linkages within the system itself, distance education, pre tertiary education and the role of the National Council on Tertiary Education (NCTE).

### **3.5 Issues and Recommendations.**

#### **3.5.1 Research Report; Limitations and Gaps**

The group agreed that the research presented needed to be more analytical and to move beyond the mere cataloguing of facts and events within the education sector. Such a detailed analysis would help to isolate factors other than SAP that have impacted on tertiary education in Ghana. It was noted that the report did not adequately establish a direct causal link between the present problems facing tertiary education and the implementation of SAP directed reforms. The attention given in the research to the conditions and facilities for special education for the physically challenged was also noted to be inadequate. So were the equity concerns raised – the focus was mainly on disparities in terms of gender access, with very little attention paid to rural urban and regional imbalances in terms of enrolment in tertiary institutions. It was also noted that the report should have made specific reference to figures in the description of student/lecturer ratios. Such data it was suggested could be easily obtained from NCTE. The study could have examined the experience of private universities at this level as a way of providing answers to cost sharing. The group also noted that the research failed to take account of graduate studies in tertiary institutions and gave inadequate account of the RECAST system.

Another gap identified was in relation to coverage. The opinion expressed within the group was that the respondents should have been drawn from the regions that provided the bulk of students enrolled in tertiary institutions.

#### **3.5.2 Quality**

The discussion on the issue of quality was based on the generally accepted premise, within the group, that socio-economic development was dependent on the productive capacity of the people of any nation. Education was that vital ingredient in the enhancement of the productive capacity of a people. The discussion did not define quality education. It was however generally held that the present quality of products of the educational system in Ghana was unsatisfactory. It was suggested that research be conducted to collect views of the users of tertiary institutions especially industry about the quality of products that they employed.

The issue of quality was also looked at in terms of the orientation of tertiary education to meet national needs. In this connection the following

observations came up and were generally accepted by the group; that the content and form of tertiary education was still based on colonial practice; that the present situation of economic failure was also the result of the inability of education to impact economic policy and that the failure in economic development impacts negatively on tertiary education. The nation for example was still unable to meet its target of student enrolment of 60% science and 40% arts in tertiary institutions.

Negative attitudes to certain forms of education like those that did not lead to a university education or did have an academic bias ended up transferred to certain forms of occupations like farming and fishing. Public and employers' perceptions of educational programmes like polytechnic and distance education were ones that tended to look down on these levels of tertiary education. Such attitudes had implications for developing such traditional occupations towards enhancing economic development. These attitudes led to the inability of education to impact national development.

Improving quality at the tertiary level ought, it was felt therefore, to include reorienting tertiary education to meet the human resource needs of the nation and not what the World Bank prescribed. Emphasis ought also to be placed on improving the knowledge base provided in tertiary education as well as opening up the minds of people trained in tertiary institutions to produce people with the capacity to innovate and lead. The salary of lecturers in tertiary institutions, participants felt, should be considered as a factor in improving the quality of tertiary institutions. Economic policies should also take account of salaries as a component for quality improvement.

Poor records keeping practices of tertiary institutions tended to produce a negative impact and needed to be improved. There was the need for institutions at the tertiary level to create a database for the entire country that would disaggregate data in order to provide more information about school leavers/applicants in terms of their gender, where they came from, the number who gained admission and those who did not.

Staff quality was also discussed and it was suggested that tertiary institutions should fix the price of their products like other industries did. Staff motivation was seen as a quality issue as well as an important element in a recruitment policy if younger lecturers were to be attracted. Other suggestions for improving the quality of lecturers included the institution of national days for honouring lecturers like it was being done for farmers and

teachers. Opportunities for life long learning and for building capacity were also needed.

### **3.5.3 Pre-tertiary Education**

The group felt that there was the need to take account of how lower level policies impacted on the tertiary level and how they affected the quality of tertiary education. Specific mention was made of pre-school education and the fact that it was urban driven and lacked governmental intervention. The group felt that government should make demands for the recognition of pre-school education during negotiations with the World Bank. The importance of pre-school education was underscored and it was felt that it would be necessary to investigate further the effect of pre-school learning, or lack of it, on other levels of learning.

### **3.5.4 Linkages**

The discussion on linkages centred on the linkage between the pre-tertiary and tertiary institutions, tertiary education and national needs as well as tertiary institutions and industry. The group made the following suggestions towards ensuring a positive link between the tertiary level and other sectors of national life. The suggestions included:

- The need for basic and tertiary institutions policy-making bodies to meet to discuss common issues and not wait for problems of one level to build up before measures are put in place at the next level to deal with such problems.
- The need to have better links with industry to determine needs that should feed into admission policies of tertiary institutions.
- The need for research findings of tertiary institutions to be made more accessible to industry.
- The need for pre-tertiary education to be placed in the context of the national economy. This would call for the structuring of the content of tertiary education so that it would reinforce the economy and the economy would in turn reinforce the education sector. Economic development and human capital development should go hand in hand. Policy making at this level had to be about what to do right in order for the economy to grow so that the products of school would not impact negatively on the economy.

### **3.5.5 Equity**

The group felt that the present policy on accommodation favoured urban-based students and needed to be reviewed to take account of rural based students. It was also noted that cost sharing did not favour the rural poor. The tendency to categorise the rural resident as poor was thought problematic since there were substantial numbers of poor people resident in urban centres often worse of than the rural resident. It was suggested that efforts to eliminate disparities in enrolment should be concentrated at the pre tertiary level. The group therefore suggested that special attention be paid to admission into the universities and efforts be made to eliminate the waiting period of senior secondary school graduates before admission to university. Members felt that low rates of enrolment for females could be a result of the long waiting period before university entry.

The final suggestion however was that income levels were the most important determinant of enrolment since it was the ability of parents to provide their children a certain type of education that provided access to tertiary institutions. It was suggested that there was a need for a closer assessment of enrolment patterns in terms of regional background of tertiary students in order to determine what imbalances existed so that policies could be put in place to avoid the creation of a class society. The group's final conclusion was that efforts should aim at improving the national economy so that parents' ability to provide good quality pre-tertiary education for their children would be strengthened.

The group found the SAP policy insistence on the removal of subsidies on tertiary education problematic because education was vital to development and market forces should not determine who gets a good quality education.

### **3.5.6 Funding**

Funding tertiary education was hotly debated and the following suggestions were offered in terms of restructuring the student loan scheme:

- The allocation of loans ought to be more selective. It should target students in need of support. The present situation where all students were automatic beneficiaries of the loan scheme was seen as inappropriate.
- The student loan scheme should be restructured in order to make it sustainable. The group was also concerned that restructuring the loan

scheme on the basis of profit could price out the very people it was being set up to benefit.

- The situation of the University for Development Studies was singled out for mention and members felt that government should show more commitment to building the university by allocating more resources to the university since it was a national asset.
- Private participation in providing accommodation in tertiary institutions ought to be promoted and institutions like GNAT was urged to invest in student accommodation as a way of compensating student members who provided substantial income to the association in terms of the dues that they paid.

### **3.5.7 The Policy Making Process**

The group expressed its dissatisfaction with the present mode of policymaking that alienated the people policy was supposed to benefit. It suggested the creation of avenues to promote the consultation of Ghanaians as well as the direct participation of tertiary institutions in the formulation of policy. The allocation of educational resources it was suggested should be based on the need to improve quality of education. The present policy on the siting of schools was criticised as inefficient. It has tended to dissipate educational resources since it only increased the numbers of schools available without any attention to quality.

Policymaking it was felt should address the issue of students who fail to progress to the next level of education especially BECE graduates. Schemes offered for their retraining should be systematised and not left to the informal sector alone.

### **3.5.8 Distance Education**

Distance education according to the group offered a great potential for increasing access to tertiary education in Ghana. The problem had been in promoting it despite the country's long association with distance education. Two main factors were identified as accounting for the failure of distance education to take off in Ghana. The first was the dual mode where universities are seeking to use the same facilities for both conventional and distance education. And linked with this was the fragmented manner in which various tertiary institutions were approaching distance education. The other factor was identified as the group of learners that the scheme was targeting - school leavers.

The group's view was that policy makers should rethink the model of distance education that was being operated at the moment and consider setting up a single institution with the responsibility for running distance education programmes. In this way the pressure on university facilities would ease. In any case in demanding more resources for distance education it was not being suggested that this should be at the expense of conventional education because distance education thrived best where conventional education was strong. Adult learners ought to be the targets of distance education programmes and such programmes ought to be designed to reach these adult learners in the workplace. Making school leavers the focus of distance education programmes was, in the view of the group, wrong since higher rates of attrition would be experienced.

### **3.5.9 Private Participation**

The group suggested that private participation in tertiary education needed to be encouraged and directed in order to ensure that courses offered in private tertiary institutions were tailored to meet the developmental needs of the country.

### **3.5.10 National Council for Tertiary Education**

The group suggested that the role of the NCTE should be strengthened so that the council would have stronger supervisory functions over tertiary institution in both the private and public sectors. The NCTE should be in a position to provide more information on its present achievements and its potential. Membership on the council ought to be expanded to include prominent members of the Ghanaian community who did not have any direct connection with academia.

## **4.0 REPORT OF SYNDICATE GROUP ON MINING**

**Chairperson: Esther Offei Aboagye**

**Presenters: Thomas Akabzaa Abdulai Dramani**

**Discussant: Professor Jacob Songsore**

**Rapporteur: Kwesi Jonah**

### **4.1 Presentation**

The main purpose of the study according to the presenter was to research into the performance of the mining sector under Ghana's SAP and the impact of mining investments on local communities.

The methodological recommendation from SAPRI was to integrate Political Economy, Gender and participatory approaches into the study. The study area was the Tarkwa Mining Zone.

#### **4.1.1 Historical phases covered**

The study covered three main historical phases of the mining industry in Ghana namely;

- (a) The Colonial
- (b) Immediate post colonial, and
- (c) Post 1986 or adjustment phase.

The most significant feature of the industry during the colonial period was that mining which in pre-colonial times had been an exclusively indigenous economic activity came under the total control of a few large expatriate companies mainly from Europe.

During the immediate post-colonial period persistent efforts were made to reverse the established colonial pattern of foreign ownership and control and bring the industry under the control of the Ghanaian state. One of the consequences was that efficient management was dealt a severe blow, the sector was plagued by acute shortage of foreign exchange, equipment became obsolete and productivity plummeted to an incredibly low level. The sector to a large extent also suffered from the deteriorating macro-economic situation, which had affected the rest of the economy and the society.

From 1986 onwards during the adjustment phase unrelenting efforts were made to revamp the sector. Sector institutions were strengthened through capacity building and enhancement. In particular the Minerals Commission was built into a one-stop shopping center for mining investments.

In terms of policy the state gradually divested itself of the ownership of mining companies until the industry substantially came into the hands of private companies. The impact of fiscal reforms was to reduce the tax burden of investors and confer on them a wide array of tax concessions. The general thrust of the policy reforms was to liberalize the mining sector to the level unknown since colonial times.

The result was a massive inflow of Direct Foreign Investments into the mining sector on a scale never before witnessed in the country's history. There was a tremendous increase in the output of all minerals; gold, diamond, manganese and bauxite. Gold production was especially high and export earnings correspondingly shot up.

#### **4.1.2 Benefits**

According to the presenter, the inflow of investment into the sector had naturally led to an increase in employment, which had gone up to 22,000 and come down again because of retrenchment. Being a capital-intensive industry, mining had tended to offer far fewer jobs than a similar level of investment in other sectors provided. Indeed after 1994 there had been a gradual decrease in the employment offered by the industry.

In spite of the fact that mining investments accounted for between 70 and 80 per cent of the total inflow of investments from 1986 onwards it accounted for between 1.5 and 1.8 per cent of GDP.

The presenter pointed out that the industry was a complete enclave and much of the benefit accrued to foreign owners rather than the Ghanaian economy. On the average mining companies retained between 75 and 95 per cent of their earnings outside Ghana.

#### **4.1.3 Impact on Communities**

While the mining companies retained their earnings outside Ghana the people of the communities in which the mines were located have paid dearly in terms of social, environmental and health hazards.

#### **4.1.4 Displacement.**

The presenter said that about 33,000 people had been displaced through relocation or resettlement away from their original homes. Families had broken up and prostitution was on the increase. Sexually transmitted diseases especially HIV/AIDS were spreading fast among the people, as were other communicable diseases such as tuberculosis, silicosis as well as respiratory infections, which had become widespread.

In addition community livelihood systems had become threatened due to environmental degradation, in particular deforestation and the removal of rich topsoils. Water sources had become polluted and the air filled with dust and dangerous substances while noise levels in the community had risen well beyond medically acceptable standards.

There was therefore the need for the legal and policy framework relating to mining to be overhauled in order to impose stronger environmental and social responsibility and accountability on the mining sector.

There needed to be effective co-ordination among the many public sector mining institutions and the current environmental laws ought be reviewed to strengthen their deterrent effect.

There was the need for a thorough cost-benefit analysis of the mining sector to ensure that the appropriate policy changes were effected to guarantee sustained and improved mining sector investment in the country.

#### **4.2 Discussants comments**

Prof. Jacob Songsore commended highly the efforts of the researchers who according to him had given the other side of mining investment in Ghana. He then put forward a three level conceptual framework for the appreciation of the findings of the research. He proposed a good balance between the desire for economic growth, human development and sustainable use of resources for the benefit of both present and future generations of Ghanaians.

While pursuing economic growth, it was necessary to also remember to pursue human development. By human development, he meant three key elements;

- (a) Access to Livelihood
- (b) Adequate Shelter and Healthy Environment
- (c) Better Governance.

At the same time there was the need for sustainable human development for both present and future generations. This implied that renewable resources such as logging, food production, cocoa and rubber etc ought to be emphasized rather than non-renewable resources such as minerals, which needed to be extracted efficiently by maximizing benefits and reducing waste and adverse environmental impacts.

### **4.3 Issues and Proposals from the Group**

In view of the ideas expressed by presenters and the discussant, members made concrete proposals to protect the interest of the Ghanaian state and local mining communities while safe guarding the legitimate interest of the foreign investor.

#### **4.3.1 Mining and National Economy: Issues and Proposals**

(a) In view of the importance of mining in the overall investment flow to Ghana participants in the syndicate group on mining devoted a substantial part of their attention to the impact of mining on the national economy. Constituting about 70 per cent of total investment flow to Ghana, mining was expected to make a corresponding substantial contribution to the GDP and the social and economic well being of Ghanaians. They were therefore surprised to know that mining accounted for a small and almost insignificant contribution to the GDP and brought very few jobs to Ghanaians.

The group was particularly concerned about the fact that the national economy derived very little from mining investments by way of earnings of foreign exchange. The liberal concessions conferred on mining companies continue to result in mining investors retaining a substantial part of their earnings abroad. The group also felt that this was a drain on the national economy.

(b) Another issue concerned the tendency on the part of mining investors to concentrate on precious minerals. Though Ghana had a rich variety of minerals, investors have tended to put almost all their attention on the exploitation of precious minerals to the neglect of other mineral deposits. The uneven attention and unequal exploitation of the country's rich array of

mineral deposits has meant that Ghana is unable to derive the maximum benefit from its full range of mineral resources.

(c) Of even greater concern to the group was the fact that the sector constituted a virtual enclave within the Ghanaian economy with little or no linkage with the other sectors. This lack of forward and backward linkages contributed to the continuing under development of the Ghanaian economy and was an impediment to the full benefit that Ghana could otherwise derive from the industry. The benefits rather accrued to foreign countries where the minerals were processed and fabricated into finished products while Ghana continued to be a raw-material producing economy with little or no prospect of developing into an industrial economy.

(d) The group also took a serious view of the actual and potential negative impact of mining activities on Ghana's forest reserves. It was observed that some of the exploration licenses given to mining companies covered areas that lie within forest reserves. The implication was that if mineral deposits were discovered the forest reserves would be destroyed by surface mining, which was now the preferred form of the mining companies. In that eventuality, tree species nurtured and protected for many years at considerable cost to the Ghanaian tax-payer would be destroyed and lost to present and future generations of Ghanaians. Members of the group were unanimous in suggesting that this nightmarish scenario be brought to a quick end.

#### **4.3.2 Proposals on Mining and the Economy**

After a detailed discussion of the issues in the impact of mining on the national economy individual members put forward a number of proposals for consideration and endorsement by all members.

a. Members arrived at a consensus on the urgent need for all mining activities and their ancillary services to be integrated into the Ghanaian economy through the formulation of an overall national policy framework, which, right from the onset, would make the investors in the sector aware of their responsibility to develop Ghana's economy.

b. The lack of linkages and its effect on the perpetuation of economic under development led participants in the Group discussion to suggest that as a matter of policy, Government should impress upon mining investors and

donors the urgent necessity for downstream processing to add value to our minerals and integrate mining fully into the Ghanaian economy.

c. Participants further suggested that as a matter of urgency the Government of Ghana should review its mining policies with the objective of attracting investments into the country's vast deposits of minerals other than precious minerals. Diversification of mineral investments could multiply the range of benefits the national economy could derive from the mining sector.

d. The group also urged the government to review its mining policies with the objective of encouraging the retention in the country of a substantial portion of mining revenues for investment in other sectors of the Ghanaian economy.

e. Participants proposed that the practice of granting of licenses for mineral exploration and exploitation in forest reserves should be stopped immediately and licenses already granted should be urgently reviewed.

f. Members also proposed that revenues accruing from the divestiture of state-owned mining companies should not be consumed now but be invested for the future development of all mining communities.

### **4.3.3 Issues in Mining and Human Resource Development**

Though human resource development is an integral part of national economic development, the syndicate Group on mining considered it to be such a critical ingredient in the process of development that they isolated it for special consideration. The huge investment in the mining sector, in the view of the syndicate group, offered an excellent opportunity for Ghana to develop a pool of skilled national manpower in all aspects of the industry, technical and managerial, to end Ghana's historic dependence on expatriate manpower in the sector.

a. Against this background participants noted with concern that some mining companies persistently refused to take Ghanaian students on practical attachment on the grounds that their training was not good enough for the industry. On the other hand, the same companies did not hesitate to take on foreign students and graduates on practical attachment for as long as a year or more. This preference for foreign students on practical attachment and rejection of Ghanaians deprived Ghanaians of the opportunity to learn

on the job and put classroom learning into practice. It was also tantamount to obstruction of the nation's drive to develop a skilled national manpower base.

b. A member of the group close to the industry revealed that a justification of the preference for foreign students on practical attachment was given by a study, which was conducted recently. According to the member, a comprehensive study was done on the mining training and related institutions and all of them were found wanting in many areas of the industry, especially in terms of the up-to-date equipment in the industry and the current literature and state of knowledge. This had posed a serious problem for the mining companies in regard to the adequacy of the products of these institutions for the purposes of meeting the requirements of modern mining. Participants nevertheless strongly suggested that "the vicious cycle" of poor products of Ghana's mining training institutions perpetuating dependence on expatriate manpower and its concomitant high cost needed to be broken.

c. With this background information some members of the group flagged a related sensitive issue for discussion. It was pointed out that up to 5 per cent of the earnings of mining companies was set aside for the payment of the remuneration of their expatriate staff, a practice that had resulted in the constant haemorrhage of hard-earned foreign exchange from the country. In the view of participants, this practice made the effective training of a Ghanaian mining manpower even more urgent.

#### **4.3.4 Mining and National Human Resource Development: Proposals**

Passionate discussion of the issues raised resulted in participants making a number of important recommendations.

a. Participants articulated the need for a thorough review of the national policy on the employment of expatriates to encourage mining companies to quicken the pace of recruitment of duly qualified and competent Ghanaian staff to replace expatriates.

b. Participants further agreed that mining companies should be encouraged to support Ghana's mining training institutions to meet the challenges of producing competent graduates good enough to meet the needs of a modern mining industry. In this regard specific areas of assistance were proposed and these included;

- a. Up-to date equipment for the institutions
- b. Practical attachment for Ghanaian students
- c. On-the-job-training for young graduates
- d. Further training abroad.

#### **4.3.5 Issues in Mining and Environmental Degradation**

Participants noted that mining in Ghana today, especially gold mining, primarily consisted of surface mining. Underground mining was no longer attractive to the mining companies and with the increase in surface mining had come a rapid degradation of the environment. The syndicate group on mining therefore spent time to critically examine the environmental degradation inflicted on the landscape and vegetation of Ghana's mining areas, especially the hills, ridges, the tropical rainforest and diverse wildlife of the Tarkwa mining area.

Participants took the view that the destruction of biodiversity due to the massive deforestation and razing of beautiful ridges represented permanent damage to the unique ecological character of the mining areas. The general feeling of the group was that no mining company should be allowed to get away with the massive environmental degradation that mining activities tended to inflict on the mining areas.

The underlying cause of the degradation was attributed to the fact that the monitoring institutions, especially the EPA, environmental and mining committees of District Assemblies were ineffective and inadequately resourced to carry out their function.

#### **4.3.6 Proposal on Mining and the Environment**

To check the continuing damage to the environment from getting any worse the syndicate group submitted a number of proposals.

- a. First the group suggested that the government should compel each mining company to post a reclamation bond to make it legally obligatory for the mining companies to set aside adequate financial resources for the purpose of satisfactory reclamation of degraded environment of the mining areas. A member pointed out that the legal provision for such a bond exists but implementation was slow.

- b. Constant and effective monitoring being the key to the solution of the problem of environmental degradation, all monitoring institutions, especially the EPA and relevant committees of the D.A.S should be adequately resourced and strengthened to carry out their responsibilities.
- c. It was also proposed that the Ministry of Local Government, through The Institute of Local Government (ILGS) should be charged to train people to man the Environmental and Mining Committees of the D.A.S. A member suggested that the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology (KNUST) School of Mines should be brought in to help with the training.
- d. The group also proposed that as was the practice in the more developed or industrialized countries, the mining companies should be encouraged to use the state of the art technology in mining which was more environmentally friendly.
- e. Since the group generally blamed the rampant damage to the environment on surface mining members urged the government to discourage surface mining and promote underground mining, which was less harmful to the environment.
- f. Members also called on the government to promote small-scale mining because the experience of people living in the mining communities indicated that it caused far less damage than large-scale surface mining.

#### **4.3.7 Issues in Mining and Health**

In the discussion of the research report the group gave as much attention to health as to the other issues. The discussions of the group were enriched by the presence of members who were health workers, residents of mining communities and others occupying important positions in some institutions of the mining sector such as the Minerals Commission.

The impact of mining on the health of people was tackled at two levels. Participants were concerned about the health of mineworkers and the inhabitants of mining communities. In the case of mineworkers, for example, it was argued that some workers would live with the health effects of mining even after they retired to their hometowns and villages.

The other health issue concerned the communities in the mining areas whose drinking water had been contaminated and air polluted by dust and

dangerous substances. It was even suggested that some residents of the mining communities might live with the permanent consequences of communicable diseases such as HIV/AIDS, Venereal diseases, Tuberculosis, Silicosis and others.

Though one member of the group pointed out that the mining companies had opened hospitals in areas where none existed before the majority position was that this could not remove the major health concerns of people whose health could be permanently impaired by the presence of mining activities in their areas.

#### **4.3.8 Proposals on Mining and Health**

Taking due cognisance of all the concerns expressed on mining and health the group took the position that a solution had to be found that would take the health of mineworkers and inhabitants into consideration and on a long-term basis. With this in mind participants proposed that there was the need for a comprehensive national policy on mine health. Such a policy should provide for the long-term health needs of mineworkers after their retirement. The policy should also make detailed provisions to guarantee the good health of people in the mining communities. The long-term health needs of mining communities could be adequately addressed only if a portion of the funds set aside for the social development of these communities was invested in community health facilities.

#### **4.3.9 Issues in Mining Community Development**

The well being of the mining communities was discussed with particular emphasis on social development. The discussion was facilitated by the copious information on the subject provided by the research report and a representative of a community based organization that spoke on behalf of people affected by mining activities in the Tarkwa area.

a). The first and perhaps also the most important issue concerned the future well-being of children from the mining communities and the need to guarantee that they would have in their youth the kind of quality education that could assure them of good jobs in the future.

The general consensus was that the mining companies with the guidance and support of the District Assemblies had a critical role to play in the education of the children of mining communities. The issue of education of children was given overriding importance when the group was informed that many

young men of the mining areas found it extremely difficult to find jobs with the mine. The official explanation usually given was that they did not possess the requisite skills and knowledge for employment in a modern capital-intensive mine.

b). The second issue addressed by the group had to do with the resettlement and relocation of communities within the mining concessions. In the case of resettlement compensation was usually inadequate. There were times also when the procedure for payment to family heads resulted in some irresponsible men absconding with the money and abandoning their wives and children to languish in poverty and misery. Members felt that the rationalization of the procedures and involvement of District Assemblies and women in every aspect of the payment could substantially protect the interests of women and children.

In the case of resettlement members generally felt that the unsatisfactory housing and inadequate space provided made the involvement of District Assemblies an urgent necessity.

c). The third issue that was raised concerned the general plight of women in mining communities even more than their male counterparts. Women virtually had no opportunities for employment in mines. The female participants in the syndicate group therefore felt that special efforts would have to be made to ensure that women could engage in alternative economic activities.

#### **4.3.10 Proposals on Mining and Community Development**

After an intensive discussion of the issues raised participants made a number of concrete proposals.

a). It was suggested that mining companies should financially support the establishment of scholarship schemes for the education of children of the mining communities and special assistance for needy children from these communities already in secondary and tertiary institutions.

b). The syndicate group further suggested that the government should thoroughly examine the options for compensation to people affected by mining investments and review and diversify them.

c). District Assemblies should be more directly involved in the resettlement and relocation of inhabitants of mining communities to ensure adequate compensation and satisfactory housing for them as well as equitable compensation for all members of the affected families especially women and children.

d). Since women benefited the least from job opportunities provided by the mines they should be assisted to engage in alternative economic activities through credit facilities from co-operatives or a Trust Fund for Women in mining areas.

#### **4.3.11 Small Scale and Illegal Mining**

Participants observed that the mining sector was plagued with numerous conflicts and one of the most persistent conflicts was that between large-scale mining companies with modern equipment and techniques and small-scale plus illegal miners using very crude and dangerous tools and techniques.

Some syndicate group members noted therefore that small-scale and illegal mining was an area, which required urgent government attention. Small-scale miners had government permits to operate officially granted, small concessions. Illegal miners commonly referred to as “Galamsey” had no legal license to undertake mining activities.

Some participants noted that small-scale operations were dangerous because some of the miners used inefficient locally improvised and dangerous techniques, which were hazardous to their own safety and even harmful to the environment. Their operations were, furthermore, tedious, time consuming and inefficient.

On the other hand the small-scale mining sector offered more jobs to Ghanaians, contributed substantially to the country’s gold output and was more beneficial to the national economy because the sector’s entire revenue was retained in Ghana.

It was also noted that several conflicts occurred between small-scale miners and government agencies when their mining activities encroached on government forest reserves. More intense conflicts continue to erupt between small-scale miners and big mining companies whose concessions were encroached upon. Very often the big companies would call on Ghana’s

security personnel to intervene and protect their concessions in the same way that the Forestry Department also used the security services.

#### **4.3.12 Proposals on Small Scale and Illegal Mining**

In the light of the foregoing, the group made a number of specific proposals.

- a). In the view of the group, government should promote small-scale mining since their activities were more beneficial to the Ghanaian economy than those of the large mining companies.
- b). Following from the above it was also proposed that government should assist small scale miners by investing some money in teaching them the techniques of safe-mining and the use of simple but efficient technologies.
- c). The group strongly appealed to the government to invest some money in exploration on behalf of and for the benefit of small-scale miners.
- d). The group also proposed that areas of exploration found by the big companies to contain only marginal deposits should be turned over to small scale miners.
- e). “Galamsey” or illegal operators in the mining sector should be encouraged to legalize their activities so that they would be able to operate freely within the law and benefit from any future training programmes and assistance that may be given to the small scale mining sector.

#### **4.3.13 Ghost Town Phenomenon: Issues**

Participants drew attention to the global and national experience of “Ghost Towns” associated with the mining industry. It was noted that everywhere in the world and in the history of Ghana’s mining industry whenever mineral reserves became depleted mine closures followed and “Ghost Towns” sprang up with no vibrant economic life and social and economic development. Mine-related industries pulled out, populations migrated and mining towns would be sometimes worse off than before the closure.

The group drew attention to Bibiani town, which became a virtual “ghost town” following gold mine closures. But for the quick decision to establish two major factories, Bibiani Wood Complex and Bibiani Metal Complex, the town would have become “clinically dead.” Even after the opening of

these factories economic life did not really return to the levels of the 1960's and early 1970's.

#### **4.3.14 Ghost Town Phenomenon: Proposals**

a). Following from the intensive discussion of the “Ghost Town” syndrome, the group proposed the drawing up of a comprehensive programme for the establishment of alternative industries in all mining areas to ensure that in the event of mine closures a new industrial economy could sustain social and economic development.

b). The government, district assemblies and traditional authorities had a responsibility to ensure that these alternative industries were planned and established long before mineral deposits get depleted and companies began to move out. The planning of the alternative industries should include the active involvement of the mining companies, which should help in the laying of the necessary social and physical infrastructure.

c). Even more important the government should urge all mining companies to finance the drawing up of a strategic plan for the total development of the mining areas.

## **5.0 REPORT OF THE SYNDICATE GROUP ON TRADE**

**Chair: Mr. John Atta Nyamekye**

**Presenter: Dr Romanus Dinye**

**Discussant: Mr. Peter Harold**

**Rapporteurs: Drs F.D. Tay and Abdul N. Issahaku**

The discussions were led by the Chairman, Mr. John Atta Nyamekye. Participants included notably the Country Director of the World Bank Ghana Office, Accra, Mr. Peter Harold, regional representatives and delegates from a cross-section of the Ghanaian public.

After welcoming participants to the Syndicate Group, the Chairman reiterated the purpose of the group session, namely to discuss the Research Report on Trade Policy Reforms and the Domestic Manufacturing Sector with a view to making recommendations for the consideration of the plenary. The Chairman then requested the leader of the Research Team, Dr. R. D. Dinye, to present an overview of the Research Report. This was followed by general discussions till the close of day. When the Syndicate Group Meeting reconvened in morning of the second day, work began with presentation of the reports of the regional fora by representatives of the 10 (ten) regions followed by discussions after each report.

Based upon the regional reports and the group discussions a draft Syndicate report together with recommendations were prepared and considered by the Group for presentation to the plenary.

### **5.1 Research Report on Trade policy Reforms.**

In highlighting the main findings of the study, Dr. R.D. Dinye, Lead Researcher, stressed that like several other African countries, the Ghanaian economy had experienced a crisis in the decade before 1980 leading to a severe decline in macro-economic performance and also in industrial production. In 1983, the Government of Ghana, with the support of its major development partners initiated an ERP and SAP to reverse the decline. After two decades of implementing SAP the decline in the economy had largely been reversed and modest but constant economic growth rates had been achieved 4 and 5% p.a. over the entire period of SAP.

He stressed that, overall however, the results were mixed and the macro-economic and trade policy reforms, implemented in the period, had succeeded in substantially increasing availability of inputs and foreign exchange to domestic industry. The reforms had also had a positive effect on export performance especially of Non-traditional Exports (NTE) and on technology transfer. He stressed that these positive achievements needed however to be seen in relation to the negative impact of the reforms on the manufacturing sector which had suffered considerable decline within the period.

He restated the purposes of the study as to examine the extent to which the decline could be attributed to the trade reforms and also determine the causes of the decline through a political economy and participatory approach.

The study concluded that the decline in domestic manufacturing was not uniform throughout the sector. Whereas large-scale and technology intensive sectors benefited from the trade reforms, the medium-scale enterprises were particularly most severely affected. Notwithstanding the analytical difficulty of disentangling the effects of the trade reforms from those of other policies, the study revealed that the general decline in domestic manufacturing was due to a number of factors including the following:

- Entrenched uncertainties in the macro-economic environment
- The inherited structure of the manufacturing sector
- Complexity of the Structural Adjustment and Trade reform policies.
- Implementation and sequencing of the trade reforms and
- Lack of industrial and management skills.

The study then went on to examine the survival strategies of manufacturing enterprises and the specific measures taken by government to address some of the difficulties that emerged. Government responses had included, in the main, the following measures:

- Promotion of NTE – Traditional Exports (NTEs)
- Institutional reforms
- Creation of Export production villages
- Establishment of Export Processing zones and

- Intensification of the promotion of FDI through the highest national authorities.

## **5.2 Discussant's Intervention**

Mr. Peter Harold, Country Director, World Bank, Accra felt that the report was a good and balanced piece of research that highlighted both achievements and failures. In particular, the report in his view, described a picture of decline in the pre-SAP period so stark as never been demonstrated before. He found very interesting the use of the term “de-industrialization” by some people to characterize the period preceding SAP and by some others to characterize the SAP era. He also commented on the report finding that medium-sized firms were more negatively impacted than both small and large-sized firms. Accordingly, it would be interesting to know why this was the case. He posed the question whether medium-sized firms were less protected than the other categories of firms?

Mr. Harold also wondered why some firms, having benefited from heavy injection of capital during the SAP, failed to sustain their initial impressive performance over the adjustment period. In this regard, he noted two things. First, SAP was often accompanied by tight macro-economic policies. These accompanying policies, which were strong in the eighties, became weaker in the nineties. What accounted for this collapse of macro-economic policies? At a time that these policies were needed to give a second round of boost to the positive impact on industry, this was missing. Second, there was a certain amount of naivety in policy-setting as though all that needed to be done was to “get prices right” and everything else would be fine. According to him very little was done in terms of analysis of firm level approach to growth and in which case very few manufacturing mechanisms existed within which small industries could grow. According to the discussant, there was, in other words, a clear absence of internal processes, or micro-economic policies conducive to the development of the manufacturing sector.

## **5.3 General Discussion**

A participant wanted to know whether SAP as it was known had ended, and if not when it would end. In response Mr. Peter Harold explained that it was possible to think SAP had indeed ended if one considered the loans and credits often associated with it. According to him no credit had been given

to Ghana in the name of SAP in the last ten years. In that sense SAP had ended. Indeed, one could say that the symbolic change of name by the IMF from SAP to PRGF marked the end of SAP. Otherwise, if viewed in the context of the desire to de-concentrate and to diversify the export base beyond the production of primary commodities to the manufacture of industrial products, then the need for reform would endure and SAP continued to be as valid today as it had always been.

Another participant wanted to know whether there was any existing literature on skills and technology audit in relation to manufacturing. She asked this question noting that there was an obvious silence on the role of human capital development in the development of the manufacturing sector. Another participant thought the report on education would have dealt with that since education was about human development. Most participants felt the need for capacity building.

A participant expressed disappointment at trade liberalization since according to him it had failed to achieve the expected objective to build the capacity of local firms to compete on a level playing field in the global market place. Rather, he thought that SAP had weakened the capacity of domestic firms to compete with foreign firms.

Following from this, concern was raised about the HIPC initiative as participants felt it was simply an extension of SAP. Mention was made of the linking of HIPC to the PRSP. To this, Peter Harold noted rather interestingly that if it were in the eighties PRSP would have been called SAP, an acknowledgement that PRSP was simply SAP. He questioned whether civil society was properly consulted.

A participant noted that no amount of SAP would help the manufacturing sector unless the country obtained a heavy injection of external assistance in the order of the Marshall plan.

Another participant thought the report should have explored the links between the agriculture sector and the manufacturing industry since, in his view, it was only the agricultural sector that could provide the required support for the sustainable growth of the latter industry.

In evaluating the impact of very high interest rates and depreciating exchange rates within the context of SAP, a participant placed squarely the

dismal performance of the manufacturing sector on World Bank policies. According to him those policies were not ideologically neutral but were a reflection of western liberal market tendencies intended to get debtor nations to continue to service their external debts. Against this background, he asked how one could expect industry to perform when SAP created an environment of high interest rates and low exchange rates. Essentially, these conditions, he observed, did not and would not support the manufacturing industry.

Coming back to the issue of PRSP, the same participant questioned the need for it at all. Rather, he thought the emphasis needed to be put on wealth creation, which could be realized through the development of five key areas, namely: Agriculture, education, health, housing and culture. The logic and efficacy of this strategy for wealth creation, he explained, lay in the fact that more jobs would be created for people to earn incomes, which in turn would mean more wealth for the country.

Still on PRSP, and with specific reference to trade, a participant felt that all issues ought to be put on the table for discussion, i.e. PRSP must not simply say that people can participate, but must also open up macro-economic issues for discussion. In his intervention, Mr. Peter Harold underscored this assertion noting that the assumption that civil society would not understand the details of macro-economic issues was patently misplaced. Hence, tax issues and other policy instruments ought to be put on the table.

Since rising interest rates and depreciating exchange rates continued to undermine domestic industry competitiveness, a participant wanted to know if government could simply come in to fix the rates. In other words, what were the implications for the manufacturing sector of the state controlling interest and exchange rates since the market under SAP had failed to do it? In his response, the chairman noted that there were other factors beyond interest and exchange rates that also affect competitiveness. He cited his own personal experience to support this claim asserting that the presence of proper revenue collection – the duty on imported goods – or the lack thereof - could make a difference between profit and loss. Indeed, this, according to him, defined his superiority over his Nigerian competitors in the terrazzo polishing business.

However, another participant thought that the solution to the interest and exchange rates problem did not necessarily rest with the government but

with civil society as well who could easily organize a street protest to denounce such debilitating rates.

Issues of gender kicked in when a female participant requested the researcher to highlight on some aspects of gender issues relating to manufacturing. The researcher thought that as a crosscutting theme gender was adequately integrated in the study although he had felt before that gender should have been investigated on its own merit. The terms of reference, he said, informed the approach to the study.

Yet another female participant raised a critical question that she herself tried to answer: Why had female-owned firms suffered more than male-owned firms? Among other things she noted that when men were laid-off as a result of SAP their wives had to support them, essentially drawing from an already stressed capital base. In other words, monies that otherwise could be used to expand their business were squandered in the up keep of their jobless husbands. The other reason for the dismal performance of female-owned firms relative to that of men was explained by the low level of technical knowledge in packaging and all the other support mechanisms that were essential ingredients for business success.

Pursuant to the foregoing, the following recommendations were proposed as possible solutions: 1) Recognize the female role in the family; 2) create humane avenues for women to access credit beyond the small amounts that are often the practice of micro-finance institutions; and 3) packaging must be developed for women to utilize.

Recognizing that markets can and do get it wrong, a participant wanted to know what alternative strategies the World Bank had in case of market failure since, in his view, that was responsible for the low performance in the manufacturing sector. He also thought the Bank had to share in the responsibility to address the mistakes since the resulting problems were usually caused by their liberal policies anyway. Mr. Peter Harold agreed that markets could get it wrong and suggested that appropriate forms of intervention had to be initiated in times of such failures.

On the vexed question of promoting domestic industrial development on the basis of the SAP model of improving manufacturing through liberalization, interest rate and exchange rate policies, the question was raised as to how many African countries could be regarded as SAP success stories. The

question was also raised about what had happened to the African Alternative, which the World Bank refused to fund because it did not conform to the SAP concept. The specific question was also posed as to whether in the perception of the SAP proponents Ghana had actually reached where it was projected to be after over 15 years of implementing structural adjustment programmes. The general consensus in the Group on this issue was that the answer to the question was a clear and unequivocal no. The World Bank needed therefore to be allowed to learn since quite clearly the Bank had not been able to provide the answers to the country's development problems, suggesting therefore that the set of policies being implemented all over the World as SAP were possibly not the right ones.

It was also pointed out in this connection that the struggle over SAP was not only about an economic model but also more about power relationships. Trade liberation imposed rules which some of the more powerful countries did not primarily observe themselves.

In that regard, globalization through the free movement of capital around the world and opening up of markets was leading dangerously to the recolonization of African countries because these countries would simply become markets for cheap labour. Globalization did not provide a level playing field that allowed all countries to produce and offer their products generally on the global market without hindrance.

In addition, therefore, to the urgent need to protect the rights of labour and provide decent jobs for workers, the challenge in the future was for developing countries to insist upon sovereignty over their own economic and social development policy decisions and continue to advocate for participation and democracy. Governments needed to make their people the first reference point in policy decisions and civil society needed also to continue to make noise in that regard.

The foregoing would necessarily have implications for the business that the World Bank did. In that regard, a case could be made for the establishment of a Social Accountability Fund to provide Civic Organisations with funds to train people in tracking the use of funds because no one could after the SAPRI exercise claim with any justification that civil society could not participate effectively in policy discussions and policy making. The PRSP and the HIPC initiatives provided the next opportunity for the World Bank to listen and learn and the Bank had to be pressurized to drop some of its

rigid macro-economic policies from the PRSP. In the light of the worldwide frustration with a process that had not worked, the challenge was to move forward with mechanisms for bringing macro-economic policy into the open and into the centre of future policy dialogue with civil society.

## **5.4 Regional Reports**

The reports of regional SAPRI Fora were presented by the regional representatives who participated in the syndicate group sessions on Trade Reform Policies. The issues raised together with recommendations are summarised below.

### **5.4.1 Upper West Region (UWR)**

It was noted that with only a few under-developed industrial establishments in the Region, the UWR was industrially the least developed region in Ghana. Although the region had the potential for producing non-traditional exports such as sheanut, cashew and cotton, the development of these products had been constrained by lack of financing because there is no Export Financing Office or Agency in the Region.

The assistance to craftsmen to improve upon the finishing of the locally made smock could make it a viable export product especially for Africans in the Diaspora.

Even though 82 (eighty-two) individuals/enterprises benefited from the Business Assistance Fund (BAF) in the Region, concern was expressed about the big imbalance in the gender distribution of the Fund. While 12 (Twelve) men got a total of ø33 million, 70 (Seventy) women got a mere ø20 million.

The reason for this imbalance was traced to the fact that generally men engaged in much larger business than women. It was stressed that the issue of the sheanut and cashew industries in the region generated heated debate at the regional forum.

It was generally agreed that overall, the SAP had incapacitated the Region as far as Trade and Industrial development was concerned.

#### **5.4.2 Upper East Region (UER)**

Based upon presentations made by Government, the World Bank and Civil Society, participants at the Upper East Regional Forum were of the view that SAP had stifled the growth and development of several sectors of the economy such as the textiles, wood and food processing industries, the service sector, the manufacturing sector as well as agriculture. On account of this, it was agreed that, the National Board for Small Scale Industries (NBSSI) should be empowered to assist small scale and medium scale industries to grow. There was the need to review the Trade Liberalisation Policy to meet the demands and needs of the country.

The following suggestions were also made:

- There should be an integrated and co-ordinated approach to improve the sheanut industry in the north.
- There should be a comprehensive policy of promoting Agro-Processing industries to cater for the cotton, rice, tomato and cashew industries in the country in general and the northern regions in particular.
- There was the need for Government to review the current policy on the development of manufacturing industries in the country.

The following measures were therefore proposed to address the problems identified:

- 1) Government should reactivate the abandoned industries and encourage local entrepreneurs by giving them long-term loans to purchase them.
- 2) Government should reduce interest rates on loans for the manufacturing sector. Interest rates on savings should also be raised to encourage local savings.
- 3) Tariffs on imported goods that could be locally produced should be raised to discourage their importation in order to encourage local production.
- 4) Manufactures should be given attractive tax holidays (or rebate).

#### **5.4.3 Northern Region (NR)**

After the presentation of a comprehensive overview of the Trade Report by a resource person, participants at the Regional Forum observed that:

- The sample used in the report was not representative since it did not cover all regions in Ghana especially the three Northern Regions.
- The report did not examine the SAP policy implementation process and also data, which was both sector and area specific.
- The study also failed to highlight the fact that trade reform policy facilitated the dumping of foreign goods on the domestic market and thus actually discouraged local manufacturing of goods.
- The report was also silent on the effect of trade policy on agricultural production and land degradation.

Noting that the infrastructure put in place to promote trade and manufacturing seemed to be based on cost recovery for the investor rather than promoting domestic manufacturing and that socio-cultural and political factors were partly responsible for the decline in the manufacturing sector, participants agreed that the poor performance of the manufacturing resulted from the SAP Trade Reform Programmes for the following reasons.

- The Ghanaian public was not involved in the formulation and implementation of the SAP.
- The rationale behind SAP was not geared towards improving the capacity of local manufacturing firms.
- The trade policy itself did not act in favour of local manufacturing, as emphasis was more on trade liberalization without any effort to protect and promote local firms.
- High interest rates coupled with high foreign exchange rates impacted negatively on operations of domestic firms.
- Investment funds from donors were concentrated on export oriented production.
- SAP did not provide safeguards against corruption and mismanagement.
- Some industries, which were hitherto viable, collapsed or experienced lower productivity in the wake of structural adjustment eg. Nasia Rice Mills, Pwalugu and Wenchi Tomato factories, GIHOC Pharmaceutical Company etc.
- There was a general lack of consultation with management and workers of local manufacturing firms as part of SAP.
- Unfair global trade terms were overlooked in the trade policy reforms.
- Removal of subsidies especially from the agricultural sector adversely affected overall domestic production of goods.

#### **5.4.4 Ashanti Region**

Discussions on the impact of trade reform policies on domestic manufacturing focused on issues relating to imports, exports, employment/redeployment and gender. It was generally agreed that the SAP had both positive and negative impacts. The general availability of machines and raw materials as well as increased competition was cited as positive outcomes of SAP. On the negative side were: lack of job opportunities for the youth, increased rural-urban migration and low wages paid by employers and increase in social vices.

The following suggestions were offered to deal with the issues raised:

- Distressed but viable industries should be promoted.
- Redeployment programmes should be implemented.
- Measures should be put in place to induce increased investment.
- Confidence should be instilled in the national currency the Cedi and production of qualitative and competitive goods should be promoted to address increased dollarization of the local economy and scramble for foreign exchange.
- Since low levels of education of women made them lack technical and managerial skills to compete effectively, women in industry should be targeted for special support and capacity building measures.
- To deal with the flooding of the local market with foreign goods selective import restriction measures should be put in place and local industries supported to grow.
- In view of the poor quality of goods and services produced in Ghana, low production of intermediate goods and the fact that the export drive for primary products was depriving local industry of local raw material (which they now had to buy at higher prices due to constant depreciation of the cedi), measures to limit the export of local raw materials, improve education/training and technology as well as protect infant industries should be introduced.

#### **5.4.5 Volta Region (VR)**

After reviewing the Research Report on Trade Reforms, the Volta Regional Forum made the following proposals:

### **Consultations with Civil Society**

- Before entering into Socio-Economic Agreements, Government should involve Civil Society.

### **Divestiture**

- The ownership of divested SOEs should be critically reviewed.
- Performing SOEs should not be divested, but rather strengthened.
- Political interference in management of SOEs should be reduced to the minimum.
- Abandoned SOEs should be revamped.

### **National Trade and Manufacturing Plan**

- Government should come up with a comprehensive Medium-Term Plan to stimulate the Trade and domestic Manufacturing Sector.
- Government Trade Liberalisation Policy must be selective and promote the development of domestic manufacturing industries.
- Trade tariffs and quotas system should be critically reviewed with our trading partners.
- Government Policies and Strategies should support the growth of domestic industries and markets so as to Reduce dependence on imported goods.
- Definite Regional Plans for Trade and Manufacturing are required.

### **Regional Investment Advisory Centres-(RIACs)**

- Government should establish Regional Investment Advisory Centres to address imbalances in manufacturing activities in some regions.

#### **5.4.6 Eastern Region (ER)**

The regional forum observed that generally the SAP had a negative impact on people as far as Trade was concerned because of:

- Lack of capital in the system,
- High cost of local and imported raw materials, and
- Absence of modern technology for industry.

Thus, much as people had anticipated some level of improvement in their lives, the SAP rather brought in its wake abject poverty to a greater percentage of the populace. In the light of the foregoing the Forum recommended the following:

- Tax exemptions granted to importers must be well scrutinized to ensure that they are actually beneficial to Ghanaians.
- Import liberalization should be controlled and not made wholesale to save our local industries.
- Exposure of local industry to unfair competition should be discouraged to avoid retrenchment of workers.
- Capital inflows should be provided for local industries to spearhead the growth of the economy.
- Foreign aid policies and their conditionalities should be studied before assimilation and implementation.
- Government should re-introduce subsidies on agricultural inputs like fertilizer, cutlasses, etc.
- Ghanaians should be encouraged to patronize the purchase of the SOEs under divestiture.
- Government should strengthen its supervisory role to remove all red-tapeism in the system.
- Government should take a positive stance on interest rate policy and also stabilize the exchange rate.

#### **5.4.7 Western Region (WR)**

It was observed at the Western Regional Forum that the instability in Ghana during the seventies and early eighties contributed to the failures of the various trade policies that were initiated. It was suggested that trade liberalization policies under the SAP killed a lot of initiatives in the domestic manufacturing sector which had been undertaken in the wake of severe drought in early 1980s. It created unfair competition due to unfair taxes and tariffs such as the taxing of raw material imports higher than finished goods. Under the SAP, there was no capacity building and financial support measures to enhance the competitiveness of local manufacturing. The SAP also killed employment at the grassroots-level. Withdrawal of support from SOEs led to the collapse of several local industries such as City Express, GNTC and GIHOC Industries. Whilst promoting export-oriented firms, SAP had not encouraged a packaging industry to enhance the competitiveness of local products.

The Forum therefore recommended that:

- Future policies should take cognisance of the fact that Women's manufacturing effort still remained at a micro-level. This should be factored into programmes to improve their prospects for growth.

- Future policies must encourage private sector participation through capacity building, capital support and favourable marketing networks.
- Tax rebates must exist for raw materials imported by domestic manufacturing firms.
- Future policies must ensure that labour laws are complied with to ensure job security in order to prevent casualization of labour.
- Government subventions of specific SOEs must not be withdrawn overnight in future policies since it creates unemployment and overburdens society.
- Future policies must encourage industrial linkages so as to ensure substantial development and growth of sectors.
- The neglect of the agriculture sector through SAP affected most local manufacturing industries.

## **5.5 Issues and Recommendations**

Based upon the presentations and the ensuing discussions, the following recommendations were made by the Syndicate Group for the consideration of the plenary.

### **5.5.1 Liberalization**

It was the considered view of the Group that the internal capacity for manufacturing in Ghana was not developed before the initiation of the liberalization policy resulting in an uneven playing field for competition. But there was no reason not to roll back. This implied a greater role for the state, some level of intervention on the part of the State in support of local industries by way of tariffs, exchange rate and interest rate policies and selective protection of specific local industries.

Again on the issue of protection and competition, it was pointed out that the operating environment was crucial for the ability of any enterprise to compete. In an unfavourable environment of high interest rates, high inflation and persistent devaluation, firms may tend to be ‘de-protected.’ There was therefore a need to take measures to counter the effects of unfavourable operating environment by supporting domestic industries through an improved macro-economic environment, an appropriate tax regime and a strengthening of the production base to meet export demand.

### **5.5.2 State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs)**

On the issue of the divestiture of SOEs the following suggestions were made:

- Ghanaian entrepreneurs and investors are to be encouraged and assisted to acquire SOEs on divestiture. It was however stressed that in so doing, measures should be taken to prevent the negative practices of corruption.
- Divestiture proceeds should not be used to support current expenditure but rather to support rapid development of local manufacturing capacity and also to retire domestic debt.
- Measures should also be taken to revive distressed but viable manufacturing firms.

### **5.5.3 Quality of Products**

Measures should also be taken to develop and strengthen the capacity of quality control institutions such as the Ghana Standard Board, Consumers Associations and the Association of Ghana Industries (AGI) to ensure that high quality Ghanaian products are manufactured for purposes of competition while also setting higher quality standards for inputs and finished products coming from outside.

### **5.5.4 Institutional Capacity Building**

The building of the capacity of institutions, manufacturing firms, entrepreneurs, women, labour and also Consumers Associations should be integrated into programmes like the SAP.

### **5.5.5 Gender**

Taking into consideration the fact that women benefited less than men from the SAP process because the limited facilities available were passed on mostly to men and the phenomenon of men taking over traditional women's occupations such as sheabutter production as a result of the redeployment policies, gender issues should be considered on their own merit in future policies and programmes.

Agro-based industries should be promoted to support women especially in the cotton and sheabutter industries and the gender component of development programmes should be more properly researched with a view to repackaging them to support both sexes.

### **5.5.6 Funding**

Considering that access to medium to long-term funding was not specifically promoted under SAP policies especially those key policies which have led to excessively high interest rates and continuous devaluation of the cedi, Government should intervene appropriately to determine the level of interest rates and institute concessionary rates to manufacturing firms.

In addition, special funds such as Business Assistance Funds and District Funds should be expanded or set up specifically to support local industry.

### **5.5.7 Infrastructure**

It was noted that local industries had not been provided with the necessary and adequate infrastructure especially in the Northern Sector of Ghana. There was an urgent need to address this issue in order to improve market access and competitiveness of local manufactured products.

A packaging industry should be developed to improve the marketability of locally manufactured goods especially those produced by women entrepreneurs.

### **5.5.8 National Trade and Manufacturing Plan**

It was stressed that there was the need for the elaboration of a National Trade and Manufacturing Plan for the development of domestic manufacturing and to enhance its competitiveness.

### **5.5.9 Institutionalisation of Stakeholder Consultations.**

It was stressed that before entering into any international agreement, which affects the development of Ghana, in such a fundamental way as the SAP, there was the need to ensure that all stakeholders were adequately consulted. In that connection the involvement and participation especially of the Civil Society in such processes of consultation should be institutionalised.

### **5.5.10 Sovereignty over economic policy decisions**

With respect to the global political economy, it was suggested that the SAP is ideologically driven such that the old economic model, which is still in vogue, is being imposed on developing countries. Developing countries however need to have a level of sovereignty in social and economic policy decisions.

It was also noted that in spite of the disadvantage of developing countries in the accumulation of capital and knowledge, they were being forced to open up their economies for competition with better endowed countries in trade and flow of capital but not in labour. It was therefore stressed that developing countries should reclaim sovereignty over their own social and economic policy decisions but not as a barrier to international cooperation and support.

#### **5.5.11 Job Creation**

It was suggested that in order to improve the performance of the manufacturing sector there was a need to create decent, well-paid jobs for the population through:

- The pursuit of food self-sufficiency and security as objectives of agricultural policy.
- Human resource development as a priority for education.
- The exploitation of the potentials of the health sector to provide jobs.
- The promotion of social housing as a policy means for creating jobs and also the targeting of the cultural sector specifically for job creation.

## **6.0 REPORT OF SYNDICATE GROUP ON HEALTH**

**Chair: Dorcas Coker Appiah**

**Presenter: S.K.Avle**

**Discussant: Vicky Okine**

**Rapporteur: Theophilus Richardson**

### **6.1 Presentation of Research Report**

The Draft Report on Health Sector Reform consisted of the following: a background to the study; health care situation in Ghana; health-related structural adjustment policies; and findings and policy implications.

The report stated, as background, that after more than two decades of the implementation of Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) policies and health-related policies, there was limited knowledge and/or information about the effects on the general population of these policies, particularly the exemptions policy, as well as the views of communities and other stakeholders regarding their roles in a health insurance scheme. The objectives of the study therefore were the assessment of community awareness of health reform policies as well as their views on developing community-based insurance schemes that would enable vulnerable groups to have access to health care.

#### **6.1.0 Methodology and Issues Addressed in the Report**

Employing the tools of participatory research methodology, the study set out to identify problem issues germane to health related SAP policies, especially as they impinged on access to health care services and the exemptions policy. The study also identified solutions recommended to deal with the problems.

#### **6.1.1 The Health Care Situation in Ghana**

The report highlighted fundamental changes that had taken place in the provision and financing of health care since independence. After well over two decades of free (public) health care services for all Ghanaians, financed from the national budget, economic decline, especially in the early 1980s, undermined the sustainability of this system. The report showed that since 1983, a significant decline had taken place in expenditure on health both as a share of the national budget (from 6.46% in 1980 to 4.38% in 1983) and as a share of GDP (from 6.46% in 1980 to 4.38% in 1983).

The economic crisis coupled with a shift in government spending priorities had also resulted in a serious deterioration in public health services and infrastructure. According to the report, the situation currently points to the existence of severe inequities in health care services, the result of inadequate health infrastructure and discriminatory practices in the health delivery system. Furthermore, conventional expenditure patterns have meant that a disproportionate chunk of recurrent expenditure goes into wages and salaries (61.6% in 1994) leaving 16.4% in 1994 as the share of drugs, the most important item.

### **6.1.2 SAP and Health Care Services**

The report recognized the many problems that remain “despite considerable progress in the health sector under SAP”. The persistence of gross inequalities not only in mortality rates between different regions and areas but also in geographical access to modern health facilities characterised the health sector. Besides the prevalence of infectious and non-communicable diseases, the report also identified weaknesses in the entire management of health services and the inequitable distribution of health personnel as critical issues facing the health sector.

It further noted that although the health sector has received on average 8-10% of total budgetary allocations, the quality and use of primary health services have remained low over time.

### **6.1.3 Health Related SAP Policies**

The report examined the question of access as a critical factor of health policy and identified three main types of access; geographical access, financial access, and access to basic services as well as two subsidiary types; social and gender access.

Tracing the introduction of medical fees in Ghana, the report established a linkage between fees and access to health care services. In the particular case of SAP policies, it noted that the introduction of user fees and other user charges for health services and investment in facilities, as well as subsequent upward revisions in these charges, were aimed at ensuring increased access to and utilisation of health services. Hence, the implementation in 1985 of the “cash and carry” as a full cost-recovery system for drugs in public health institutions was meant to “improve and

sustain the availability of essential drugs and provide all public health facilities with safe drugs at affordable prices”.

The most notable Health sector policy reforms under SAP were:

- a. Introduction of user fee charges.
- b. Expansion and strengthening of district health services.
- c. Reallocation of resources away from the regions to the district levels.

Other reforms involved measures aimed at reducing costs and improving overall management of health services.

Quite significantly, the report noted the establishment recently of a legal structure for the implementation of the Ghana Health Services; the underlying objectives being establishing equity, efficiency and accessibility, enhanced quality care as well as improving capacity building for policy, inter-sectoral collaboration and performance monitoring.

#### **6.1.4 The Exemptions Policy**

This policy was introduced to alleviate the potentially negative impacts of aspects of the health reform policies such as the withdrawal of subsidies and introduction of user fee charges and in 1992 of the “cash and carry” scheme for households and communities. The exemptions policy covered certain categories of people, including the poor, paupers, children under 5 years old and elderly people aged 70 years and above and pregnant women, among others. Though the policy has been financed with a 5% allocation of annual budget, the implementation, it was observed, has been fraught with many problems, some being definitional ones.

#### **6.1.5 Summary of Findings**

##### **Access**

The report confirmed findings of earlier studies that high hospital fees represented a barrier, both financially and socially, to health care facilities for many patients. In the circumstances patients resorted to self-medication. Apart from this, the negative attitude of some health staff also created social barriers to access of health facilities.

Additionally, distance, high cost of travel, and expenditure on health services as a percentage of total household expenditure were considered key

determinants of the utilisation of health facilities. This was particularly important for most people in rural areas. Primarily for this reason, very few respondents would support the idea that households take up the additional burden of taking care of the health needs of members of households unable to pay for their own health needs.

### Exemptions Policy

The study found that the exemptions policy had not been as effective as expected for the following reasons. First, there was some ignorance about the policy among many people and this was pronounced especially among women with children under 5 years in rural communities who paid for everything at all visits to health facilities. Second, those who knew of the policy lacked knowledge of the exact content of the policy. Only a few people therefore enjoyed free medical care.

According to the report, two factors have necessitated a review and extension of the policy to capture more potentially vulnerable individuals/groups. One was the high population growth rate and consequent demographic and social changes and the second, the ineffectiveness of the PHC programme.

The report finally indicated that most people felt that the central government should finance health care for those unable to afford health services. In this regard, the DAs were expected to play a vital role as partners in the development of health delivery at the district level.

### Health Insurance Scheme

On health insurance an important finding was that coping strategies adopted by communities in times of urgent medical need could be developed along the lines of welfare clubs and financial associations to form the nucleus of a community-based health insurance scheme. Further to this, the study also established that institutions such as churches, family and community could be mobilised to form the basis of a health insurance scheme. Its main recommendation was for more education in communities on health policies and programmes and their role in PHC issues.

## **6.2 Discussant's Intervention**

The discussant summarised key areas of the study and at the same time drew out gaps in the report. She noted that the analysis of the correlation between

health, poverty and rights as well as between poverty and macro economic policies was not adequate.

She also drew attention to some limitations in the framework of the study. According to her, the study tried to understand the social impact of SAP on the health status of Ghanaians from the supply side by focusing on the exemptions policy, access to public health facilities, infrastructure, services etc. Beneficiary views/perspectives, critical in any social impact study were inadequately represented in the report.

Also, in her view, the focus on the exemptions policy did not offer the appropriate opportunity for assessing the social impact of SAP. The problems of low coverage and weaknesses in the implementation coupled with definitional problems of a poor person rendered the policy neither inclusive nor representative.

The discussant subsequently argued that if the objective of SAPRI was to involve civil society in the evaluation of the social impact of macro economic policies (on the health sector in this instance), together with government and the World Bank, an important starting point would be an analysis of the overall social and economic context within which health systems functioned. This would be rooted in understanding the relationship between health, poverty and rights; demand and supply in health systems and how the needs of the poorest were adequately met or not met; how these arrangements functioned within the framework of the macro economic environment under study.

Elements in such an analysis could include an analysis of poverty, trends in national health indicators, disparities in those indicators and their impact. Other elements would be the dynamics of social exclusion, primary stakeholders' perspective and vulnerability as well as the national, sectoral and policy framework.

The discussant noted that the study discussed some of the policies in the health sector. This discussion could have been informed by the MOH's review of the performance of the 5-Year Programme of Work and the Medium Term Health Strategy.

She observed that poverty was a dominant theme running through the framework of the study. Analysis therefore could have included; a

definition of who constituted the poor; how was poverty to be defined in national statistics; variations in poverty levels (regional, rural/urban, gender, etc.); identification of the most disadvantaged groups etc. She emphasized that poverty was not simply an economic phenomenon. It had a direct relationship to vulnerability and social exclusion – the process by which disadvantaged groups were excluded from full participation in their society and how people were placed at the risk of poor health outcomes. Also poor health was not solely attributable to poverty but to processes and forms of exclusion – the extent to which marginalised and vulnerable groups were able to realise their rights to protection from risks, access to services and resources. As such key issues that the research needed to assess would include:

- Gender relations of power and control,
- Local health knowledge and belief systems,
- Social access to services and appropriateness of services to local context (i.e., quality of care from the primary stakeholders perspective).

The discussant generally underscored how critical it was to grasp the social context within which health was experienced, within which health systems functioned in order to understand the impact of health policies. She hoped that the framework spelt out would contribute to a better evaluation of the social impact of SAP on the health of Ghanaians.

### **6.3 Discussions**

Discussions covered issues relating to user-fee charges and access to health services as well as the exemptions policy. The following were some of the observations, perspectives and recommendations from emanating from the group discussion.

#### **Access**

The main concern that engaged the attention of participants was geographic and financial access to health services. Two key observations were made. First, it was noted that the dispersed location of health facilities from settlements imposed substantial costs that represented a huge disincentive to access. For instance in some areas of the Northern Region some health facilities were located about thirty kilometers away from major settlements. This situation imposed on the people in such areas substantial travel costs as

well as lost incomes from foregone production. Further, travelling long-distances for health services involved a lot of risks and inconvenience. For example, pregnant women who experienced labour have had to be carried on bicycles to the nearest health facility and late arrivals had resulted in serious health complications and even death.

Second, with respect to financial access, participants noted that the introduction of user charges against a backdrop of continuous decline in the real wages/earnings of many Ghanaians coupled with increasing poverty were responsible for poor access to health services.

Another important factor, which was recognized as impacting adversely on access to health services and health care generally, was the attitude of health care personnel. This influenced communities' attitude either to use or not to use available health services provided by government. Participants pointed out that the harsh and undignified treatment of patients meant that they usually did not return to government facilities either for a follow-up care or to report new cases. Increasingly, patients were resorting to pharmacies and private clinics for health services because they were perceived and/or do indeed represent places of quick and dignified and quality service. However, it was noted that the high quality care compensated for or justified the higher charges, though the latter was nevertheless an obstacle to access for the many poor in society.

As a corollary to the above, participants raised the fundamental issue of the low and unacceptable health care personnel (doctors, paramedics, nurse) to patient's ratio. Two positions emerged. On the one hand, some participants attributed this situation to poor remuneration and conditions of services of health sector personnel, and urged that these needed to be addressed if the quality care/services in government facilities could be improved. On the other hand, other participants argued that the issue of poor remuneration and conditions of services was not unique to the health sector; not unlike poverty, it was a crosscutting national problem that needed a holistic and comprehensive treatment.

Group members considered the cash and carry policy as one factor that hindered access to health care. Participants noted that in view of the fact that individuals and families/households were already overburdened, alternative strategies providing social safety nets in order to alleviate the cost implications of health care needed to be explored to improve access to health

care. While recognizing that the experience of susu and Youth and other informal self-help organizations/institutions for providing financial and various forms of material and social assistance could be adapted to meet the health needs of individuals and communities, it was noted that such organizations/institutions were plagued by problems of premium payment, management, and accountability. In addition, the proliferation of associations and organizations, it was felt, posed problems of co-ordination and leadership.

It was generally agreed however that the co-operative system promised greater prospects in enhancing access to health care. In this connection, the Nkoranza scheme, a community – based insurance scheme, which is based on farmers co-operatives was discussed. It was agreed that innovative ways to encourage contributions to insurance schemes should be devised. For instance it was suggested that in some of the northern regions, it might be difficult to ask the people to contribute cash because they did not have it. Such people could however be asked to contribute a tin or two of maize or millet which could be sold and the money credited to them.

However some participants observed that in some areas up-front provision of care before payment on the initiative of the provider engendered goodwill in the community especially in dealing with problems of a moral nature such as payment default.

A number of recommendations were therefore put forward to ease the problem of access. Participants repeatedly emphasized the role of government and particularly District Assemblies (DAs) in health services/care provisioning and financing. It was strongly suggested that the DAs should allocate a substantial proportion of their Common Fund to provide health infrastructure for communities. Furthermore, participants recommended the expansion of facilities for first-point-of call such as health post, polyclinics, etc. to improve geographical access to health care as well as to relieve the pressure on referral/regional hospitals. Quite significantly, expansion of Mobile Health services to dispersed and remote communities received substantial attention.

In addition to addressing the problems of access relating to distance, participants cited the case of CHIP (Community Health Improvement Programme) currently operating on a pilot basis in parts of the country for study and replication. Under this scheme, community health nurses lived in

the communities and visited households on a regular basis to provide health care. The significant feature of the scheme, it was noted, was that the presence of the health workers assured ready care to the community, though this covered mainly patients with non-life threatening cases that did not require elaborate examination and medication. Again, the role of civil society organizations (CSOs) was considered as crucial to health care services. It was recommended that (CSOs) should collaborate with government to make them fulfill their obligations to their communities.

Finally, capacity building of community members was considered a way of helping to ease the problem of distance and, particularly, the risks associated with labour and safe-delivery. Participants thus suggested a study of values that influenced take-up of services, as well as social organizations, to identify unregistered, non-professional TBAs, for training and effective, supervised delivery of in-laws, especially in the Northern regions of Ghana where a participant explained it was a taboo for non-relations to provide such a service.

#### SAP, User Fee Charges and Exemptions Policy

The exemptions policy was introduced under the Five Year Action Plan, and in particular in response to problem of access to health care arising from the introduction of user-fee charges and the cash and carry system. The policy was subjected to critical scrutiny. Two fundamental flaws inherent in the policy were identified: Definitional issues and implementation issues. A third issue, relating to balance between types of care also received attention.

#### A) Definitional Issues

The policy stipulated that free care be given to children under 5 years and the elderly aged 70 years and above, as well as for specific diseases. But participants noted that lack of clarity in the formulation of the policy meant that it was subject to differing interpretations, which led to several implementation problems. For one thing, it appeared the Districts could implement the policy differently, leading to the example of varied ways or models of implementation. For example, a participant from the Upper-West Region informed the group that the region found the age of 70 years too high to cover many needy patients, and had therefore applied the policy to patients aged 60 years and above. This meant that such regions expended their budgetary allocations for the policy faster.

## B) Implementation Issues

The lack of procedure for implementation of the policy brought up the issue of eligibility. It was pointed out that there were no procedures to determine the eligibility of patients for services. Participants wondered whether a means test could be used to determine eligibility. As a corollary to the above issue, participants indicated that lack of clarity in policy created problems of determining what services under the policy were available to children of five years and below. Similarly, whereas the policy provided for acute emergency care for the aged, most cases reported were of chronic nature. Both issues imposed greater cost burden on the health budgets of districts. In the circumstances, participants noted, the ceiling on spending meant that resources were thinly spread to cover care, thereby undermining effectiveness (in terms of coverage).

In the area of exemption for pregnant women, some striking observations were made with respect to practices of pregnant women and the balance between antenatal care and delivery services.

First, it was noted that while the policy provided for free ante-natal care for the first four visits, some women devised subtle ways of circumventing this limit, usually by moving from one health centre/facility to the other, and thereby making more than the limited four visits for free. This practice inevitably affected indices upon which providers based the administration of the policy, and consequently exerted enormous pressure on available funds.

Second, a participant (a medical doctor by profession) raised the issue whether exemption for pregnant women should cover ante- or post-natal care. She argued that since maternal mortality occurred during childbirth and the cost of hospital delivery was much higher than for antenatal care, most women were not delivering in hospitals. She therefore opined that the policy needed to be reviewed probably in favour of child delivery care.

Two positions emerged. Much as many participants agreed with her views, others were of the view that ante-natal care was just as important, as it provided the opportunity for symptoms that could lead to child and/or maternal mortality during childbirth to be diagnosed and treated. There was consensus among participants that there was the need to review the policy to achieve a balance between the two types of care in view of the still high incidence of infant mortality at birth, while more TBAs should be trained to reduce maternal mortality.

Another major issue that came up for discussion was the lack of knowledge/information on the policy. Participants pointed out that many potential beneficiaries did not know of the existence of the policy, and this meant that they could not take advantage of it. Related to this issue was the observation that the implementation of the policy continued to be influenced by the introduction of user-fee charges introduced under SAP and subsequently the cash and carry system. Moreover, health care personnel/doctors, paramedics, nurses, administrators etc. exploited the situation to enrich themselves. On these developments participants deplored the failure or inability of patients who are entitled to benefit from the policy to challenge persistent instances of malfeasance on the part of health personnel.

On the whole, participants noted that there was overemphasis from the exemptions policy, and the health policy generally, on curative care. Participants were largely of the view that some diseases were preventable and there should be a balance between the preventive and curative care, while at the same time communities should be encouraged to practice preventive health care. It was strongly noted that different emphasis on curative and preventive health care at different times created imbalances.

Many participants highlighted problems associated with inadequate allocations of funds under the policy to civil servants, and this was exacerbated by lack of reliable means for identifying civil servants eligible for the facility.

As well as ceilings on exemptions funds, untimely and irregular reimbursement of funds to hospitals and individuals undermined efficiency and effectiveness of the policy.

Besides, it was agreed that accessing health care involved more than available structures. Indeed, the fact that the exemptions policy did not operate at regional hospitals called for more polyclinics, highlighting the problem of access.

In addition, there was consensus that the exemptions policy needed to be reviewed in light of significant changes in the demographic structure of society, the continuous decline in the economic circumstances of Ghanaians, as well as the dwindling financial capacity of government to sustain the

policy. Clearly, government lacked the capacity to fund an exemptions policy for a rapidly increasing population with a high ratio of the adolescent female group.

Also, participants emphasized that the provision and financing of health care was a fundamental responsibility of government. Accordingly, the dominant view was that in the era of the Highly Indebted Poor Country (HIPC) Initiative and its relative emphasis on poverty reduction and investments in social services, gains from debt relief must be channeled into the health sector.

Again, a key recommendation related to more education on existing health policies since, it was felt that that was crucial to both access and take-up. Participants agreed to a suggestion that the mass education unit of the Department of Community Development be revamped to help out. At the same time most participants agreed that the solution to health care lay in a National Health Insurance scheme.

It was further recommended that it should be possible to employ trained social workers at each health facility to help out with problems identifying paupers for exemption. Most participants urged that eligibility for exemption needed to be reviewed in terms of means/income rather than age. At the same time, community based research could be conducted to determine those unable to pay and who should be targeted for exemption. It was, however, considered the responsibility of governments to finance traumatic emergency cases in order to remove inequities.

To enhance efficiency and cost-effectiveness participants were unanimous that regulations on drugs listed for exemptions care should be rigidly enforced and adhered to.

The exemptions policy, while still in operation, should cover all pregnancy related ailments or diseases as well as growth – retarding ones. The establishment of a Health Fund was also recommended. It was suggested, among others, that a 5% tax or levy be imposed on exports and imports. As part of this, a special levy could be imposed on urban residents to finance rural health care.

## National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS)

Following on the conclusions pertaining to issues of access to health care and implementation of the exemptions policy, the NHIS came up for discussion. Participants advocated for the scheme for the following reasons. In the main, it was argued that the NHIS, as a recurrent theme for discussion in the public arena, meant that it needed to be explored not only on its own merit, but also in light of the following additional reasons. In the view of the group, the fiscal crisis of the state meant that the option of abolishing the cash and carry system was foreclosed, at least in the short-term. Also the problems associated with existing policies called for their review in terms of both content and implementation. It was also felt that Ghanaians were becoming conscious of the need to contribute financially to health care delivery and that the particular needs of the poor could receive careful consideration in such a scheme.

Participants noted that a health insurance system comprised 3 parties, namely policyholders, insurance companies, and health institutions or providers. Three issues had emerged in relation to such a scheme: (i) premium payments; (ii) emphasis on occupational groups to the exclusion or neglect of the unemployed; (iii) need for seed capital.

Broad agreement pointed to the need for the formulation of a national policy framework for a NHIS within which decentralized and community – based initiatives (CBIs) could be worked out and operated. To this end, the experiences of co-operatives and Susu groups could provide insights and help introduce safety – nets to cover security of health care for members. Some innovative community-based insurance schemes were also discussed. Notable among these was the Nkoranza scheme. A participant from the Eastern Region elaborated on aspects of two main types of insurance schemes – for-profit and not-for-profit schemes. He also pointed out that the profit schemes comprised friendly and more friendly forms. Though the friendly form emphasised premium payment, it was limited in scope, whereas the more - friendly forms were comprehensive in nature. On the other hand, the CBIs were not-for-profit schemes and it was strongly argued that this form held much promise. He briefed participants on features of the Alpha Emergency Medical Fund in Koforidua and suggested it should be considered for replication. While most participants agreed that it was a good scheme, it was generally agreed that conditions under which it operated were not representative enough to argue for adoption on a national scale. However, it was agreed that DAs must encourage such innovative schemes.

An important issue that received extensive and informed discussion was payment of premium under CBIs. Participants recognized that since the needs of the poor under any insurance scheme were critical to success, differing conditions in different parts of the country dictated that CBIs needed to adopt different approaches to premium payments or contributions to schemes. For instance, it was pointed out that in some areas of the northern regions, as for many other parts of the country, it might be difficult for individuals and households to contribute cash (as premium), because of extreme poverty. But such people could instead make contributions in the form of, for example, a tin or two of millet or maize, which could be sold and the proceeds credited to their premium charges. Additionally, participants opined that social attitudes to health issues as well as expenditure priorities and practices of different social groups, especially in poor and/or deprived communities, could be taken care of by CBISs.

It was generally agreed that the requirement for premium payment may aggravate the problems of the poor more than the cash and carry system, and therefore, though the CBIs were important, they could not be substitutes for national level interventions that provided for the poor.

With respect to the issue of seed capital for CBIs, participants were broadly agreed that it required innovative strategies to mobilize funds. Recommendations that captured the concerns of participants had to do mainly with the role of government in health care provision and financing and the role of DAs. For governments, participants recommended a greater role than the provision of infrastructure; while DAs were urged to educate people at the village level to embrace community-based mutual health initiatives already in place.

In terms of contributions to such schemes, community based surveys could be undertaken to determine various ways members could contribute. Equally important was the complementary role of private health facilities in NHIS and community health care. According to most participants, quality of service from the perspective of health providers depended largely on facilities and equipment and this was a crucial consideration in community health care.

Similarly, it was recommended that a platform or framework be created for collaboration and/or partnerships between orthodox health practitioners and traditional health practitioners.

Moreover, industries as part of their social responsibility to communities, should contribute to CBIs. Other CSOs like churches could also contribute, and/or together with decentralized institutions be strengthened to mobilize resources to support the health delivery system.

In conclusion, participants called for a gradualist approach to the achievement of a universal health care delivery system.

## **7.0 PLENARY SESSION: RAPPORTEUR GENERAL'S REPORT**

The rapporteur general's report covering the two days of discussion just completed was presented to participants in a plenary session. This was followed by contributions from the floor in which participants raised issues that they thought were not given adequate coverage in the report as well as other issues.

Participants stressed the need to have accessibility and equity policies that would redress the discrimination against the poor, which SAP had failed to deal with. Admission policies of the universities therefore, it was pointed out, needed to take into consideration the unfavourable conditions that the poor studied under and needed to include positive discriminatory policies in favour of applicants from poorer sections of the country. Others stressed the need for improving the quality of poor schools in order to save the nation the loss of precious human resources unable to realise their potential as a result of inadequate education.

Other participants called for improvements in entrepreneurship training that was currently available in the country. It was also felt that counselling in schools should be well coordinated to emphasise the self worth of learners.

The inability of the SAPRI secretariat to present the research report on Agriculture for discussion at the forum was discussed. It was felt that the agriculture report was central to the discussions at the forum because of the importance of the sector to the national economy as well as the number of people the sector engaged. The observation was that food self-sufficiency and food security was what would help eradicate poverty. It was proposed that the house resolve to bring the leader of the research team to book. The leader, it was suggested by some participants, should be asked to apologise to the nation, refund all monies paid for undertaking the research and in addition face prosecution.

Participants commended the SAPRI process and hoped that after the exercise civil society would continue to empower itself to engage in economic dialogue. The need to empower people in order to enhance their participation in economic decision-making was central to contributions from several participants. It was felt that the civil society group that evolved to carry the SAPRI exercise through should not be allowed to disintegrate. The involvement of civil society in economic dialogue, it was felt, would help to

drive home the principle that World financial institutions did not have unlimited powers of negotiation. It was also recommended that civil society groups should insist that all policies should be accepted in developing countries before implementation. And that it should be illegal to transfer technology rejected in the developed countries to developing countries.

SAP policy on poverty eradication was criticised as wrong. It was felt that economic policy should be about wealth creation and not poverty reduction.

Participants felt that the report on mining did not give adequate coverage to how wasteful small-scale mining could be and what its environmental impact was. The report did not emphasise enough the low or negative returns of small-scale mining to the individuals involved. All researchers were taken to task for not looking at what was intrinsically wrong with the national economy and how factors that were cultural could have contributed to the present state of affairs. Of the four research reports presented only one covered the situation in the north of the country. As a section of the country, which featured low levels of poverty such an omission, participants at the forum felt, was problematic to the final conclusions of the research reports.

## **8.0 PANEL DISCUSSION: BEYOND SAPRI - THE WAY FORWARD**

A panel consisting of the following made presentations on the question of the way forward:

Mr Adu Amankwa – CIVISOC

Dr Yao Graham – SAPRI Africa Office

Dr G. A. Agambila – GoG

Mr Peter Harold – World Bank

Mr Doug Hellinger – SAPRIN

### **8.1 Mr Doug Hellinger – SAPRIN**

The speaker began by outlining the focus of his presentation as:

- SAPRI at the global level
- Post SAPRI
- The world of civil society/SAPRI and the need to create opportunity for opening up to new members of civil society groups to join the initiative.

He explained that at the global level SAPRI activities were basically at the stage where country reports were being synthesised. He noted the World Bank's insistence on a separate synthesis in contravention of the spirit of participation, which had been followed throughout the process. The global synthesis would organise the report according to themes and present the debate that emerged to the World Bank which would be challenged to respond as to how these findings would be applied to decision making processes.

The end result of SAPRI he hoped would be a joint report that would create a platform for the participation of civil society. He emphasised the importance of the exercise as offering civil society a bigger, ultimately legitimate voice in its efforts to bring about change especially in getting financial institutions to do things differently. He felt this change was important because of the need to rethink present economic policy and look for new answers to poverty eradication. Fighting poverty, which is the present focus of economic policy, is important in that it is about ensuring that people have viable living wages. Efforts therefore should be directed towards looking for resources to support Poverty Reduction Strategy Programmes that are currently being formulated. For him the insistence to

push a certain policy despite the fact that it had failed everywhere was criminal and history would judge those responsible.

Capitalism he noted tended to go through cycles of crisis and the present series of crisis of failing policies regionally and nationally had been building up for the past 20 years. He noted how centres of protest had shifted to the west and was optimistic that before the complete collapse of capitalism people would have organised to bring about change. Civil society would have to organise itself to be at the front of the push for change.

## **8.2 Dr Yao Graham – SAPRI Africa Office**

Africa, according to the speaker, was one continent that had many governments accepting SAP and HIPC and among the eight countries going through the SAPRI exercise four were from Africa. He went on to talk about the experience common to all the African countries. The issues selected for research in all the participating countries were very similar and centred around agriculture, trade and social services like education. Other similarities had to do with the civil society - government relationship and how on the whole government enthusiasm in the exercise had been very low, ranging from the Ugandan experience of low participation with support, through the Ghanaian one of passivity to the policy of conscious non-engagement in Zimbabwe.

For him SAPRI offered the opportunity to break the unity of governments and the Bank and the Fund against the peoples that governments represented. The legitimacy of policies became dubious when governments entered into agreements with the financial institutions without consultation with the people they represented.

He noted the relationship that had been forged between civil society groups and intellectuals who were often prepared to work for free or for lower than market rates. The challenge, in his view, was how to develop and expand the relationship.

Other challenges included how to broaden the content of the tripartite consultation; how to ensure that the process of economic policy making is democratised; the need to build coalitions across the continent whilst at the same time putting up strategies to empower civil society in Africa in order to help improve the visibility of African civil society groups. He also lamented

the absence of the IMF in these discussions because of the Fund's importance in policy making. He stressed that civil society effort should be geared towards improving the participation of the IMF in the discussion of alternatives and the need to consult the people who were affected by economic policy that the Fund generated.

### **8.3 Peter Harold – World Bank**

The speaker's intervention was more in the form of reactions to some of the contributions that came from the floor in the various syndicate groups as well as the debates at the plenary sessions. His first reaction was to explain that the insistence on poverty reduction did not negate wealth creation. A criterion indeed for assessing SAP could be the extent to which it did bring about a reduction in poverty.

He said it was important to find a way to build lessons into future programmes and to do business differently. He suggested three ways in which this could be done.

The first was the need to institutionalise the process of consultation, which had been going on as a series of ad hoc events. It was necessary to turn these events into an institutionalised process of consultation. It was also necessary as part of this for civil society to have a democratic basis, a structure that showed how it was representative. This he suggested would make them a powerful organisation just as their private sector colleagues had been able to effect something with a democratic basis through the private enterprise foundation. It would then be possible to have a forum where decisions could be kept to permanently and on an automatic basis to the four with government, the international institutions and the private sector.

The second way in which to build lessons into future programmes was the PRSPs. He stressed that it was important to have all aspects of the PRSP open to debate and he gave the assurance that once civil society attested to the fact that consultation was inadequate the Bank would not take it to the next stage. The Bank was also ready to provide resources for improving the ability of civil society to participate in economic decision-making by offering training in monitoring and tracking of resource allocation and monitoring and evaluation. He concluded by assuring the forum that the bank was ready to listen and ready to learn and that no one could now say

after the forums so far held that civil society could not contribute to economic policy making in the most fundamental way.

#### **8.4 Mr Quist-Therson – (Representing GoG)**

The Deputy Minister noted that 3 days of collaborative work involving government, Civil Society and World Bank in the 2<sup>nd</sup> forum had yielded useful lessons.

A key lesson was the recognition of the need to include Civil Society organizations in policy formulation, implementation and evaluation of social and economic policy.

He noted that this was indeed provided for in the 1992 constitution and that the current administration was committed to that way of policy formulation implementation and evaluation.

He was of the view that the good relationship developed with Civil Society in the course of SAPRI had opened a new chapter of relations of co-operation as the new administration was seeking to launch new policy initiatives to manage the economy, reduce poverty and create wealth to sustain accelerated social and economic development. Government, he said, would ensure a proactive participation of civil society and other stakeholders in economic management.

He identified targets such as working towards a meaningful coalition and ensuring that civil society was involved in awareness creation in the assessment of the impact and efficiency of public sector activities, access to policy information which would enable civil society to play a positive role as the key ones Government was committing itself to as part of the way forward.

#### **8.5 Mr Adu-Amankwa – CIVISOC**

For the speaker two important lessons gleaned from the forum were the concluding remark from Peter Harold about the fact that the Bank was ready to listen and learn and the point that SAP had not provided answers for development. The failure of SAPs meant that the set of policies that were being pushed around the world were not those that would enable Ghanaians

to develop. The problem however was that many seemed to think that there were no alternatives for development.

He went on to talk about globalisation and the fact that the way it was being promoted ran counter to the need to protect the rights of citizens and the rights of labour. The demand of globalisation for the opening up of markets only favoured those with capital. He noted that many people now shied away from calling globalisation by its real name - re-colonisation. Any consideration of globalisation should take account of the fact that it does not offer a level playing field. And yet, countries should be allowed to get onto the market as respectable competitors.

According to him, the challenge facing Ghana was the need to insist on a certain amount of sovereignty over decision-making. Civil society groups needed to insist on government making the people of Ghana the first reference point in policy making. He informed the Bank of the desire of Ghanaians to take control of their own destiny and try alternatives that the Bank may not approve and added that that should not lead to a cessation of the relations between the Bank and the country. The Bank ought to be ready to examine alternatives that countries had to offer.

The major challenge at present, he said, was readiness to build CIVISOC and to use CIVISOC. The present body of CIVISOC was, according to him, the most representative of civil groups in the whole country. There was the need for members to first of all take themselves seriously and to nurture the relationship between civil society groups and intellectuals. There was also the need to ensure that the old values of self-reliance, self-sacrifice survived because individualistic values could not be used to build social change organisations.

## **8.6 Open Forum**

The discussions opened with concerns about the absence of political leaders. The question, which was asked, was how the views expressed at the forum would reach government if representatives were not present. The question was also put to the World Bank representative to explain to the forum the difference between HIPC and SAP and what gains Uganda had made from joining the HIPC initiative.

The argument was made that developing countries did not have any alternatives for development. This was what made it possible for the Bank to determine how they would develop and thereby get subjected to all forms of experiments. And yet the Bank had made terrible mistakes in both theory and practice and did not have new models to deal with the problems of the world. The question then was; who was to pay for the mistakes of the Bank and the Fund. It was considered necessary for developing countries to develop a deep philosophical understanding of the Bank and for the bank to leave developing countries alone since it had no answers for their problems.

A point was also made about the value attached to local intellectuals. Low remuneration would make intellectuals of the country take any low salary offered them and it was necessary for the Bank to stop discriminating against third world intellectuals.

A point was also made about the need for Ghanaians to develop a change of attitude and a sense of commitment. Reference was made in this connection to the research team that was charged with the work on agriculture for SAPRI.

The big question that was asked was how to maintain the CIVISOC group after SAPRI and how much participation of CIVISOC would be enough.

The Chair asked for some conclusive statement in the form of a resolution to take participants from the Forum as indicated by some floor members. A resolution that sought to redress the failure of the agriculture research team to fulfil their mission was presented for consideration. After some discussion the Chair called for its withdrawal because, in his judgement, the resolution was too narrow and tended to diminish the note on which the Forum had concluded.

## **9.0 Closing Remarks: Prof Akilagpa Sawyerr, Chairman of TNSC.**

In his closing remarks the Chairman noted the centrality of the research review to the SAPRI exercise. The research process, the research product as well as the contributions from the floor and in the syndicate sessions amounted in his opinion, to some comment on the SAP process that could be taken to government and beyond.

He also emphasised the absences and gaps of research design and coverage commented on by some participants. He felt that it was crucial to give the research the right balance by rectifying these. The gaps created in the product because of the absence of the agricultural sector study as well as the omission in terms of coverage of the Northern Savannah ecological zone were important dimensions, which he thought needed to be corrected. This could in his view be done perhaps by drawing on research being done all over the country. In any case if these were not rectified, that would not be the end of history and work would have to continue beyond the present.

Still on the question of the limits of the research, the Chairman said that it was not possible to discuss SAP and the Ghanaian economy without taking into account what was happening in the external environment i.e. actual movements in the global economy. These played a critical part in determining the margins that Ghanaians had to shape policy.

Yet another absence, in the Chairman's view was the IMF. The World Bank had made an effort to be inclusive. The IMF however continued to remain aloof and it was necessary to insist that they ought to open themselves up more to people on whose behalf they were making policy.

Apart from the gaps that tended to weaken the report, the Chairman drew attention to a major conceptual flaw in much of the work – that of attribution. To what extent could one say that such and such happened because of SAP?

He however addressed this problem by suggesting that what was key was that it had been possible to establish that even with SAP certain things did not happen. Areas had been identified in which the programme had failed, going by its own terms. He thought that the review process marked some progress because it gave the chance to explore and speak words which were once taboo.

He went on to observe that events had occurred and movements in the economy and policy of the country had taken place that had created a situation in which there was complete exposure of the falsity of some of the assumptions that had been part of the background of SAPs. As a result the World Bank was confronting the reality of global complaints and SAPRI needed therefore to be careful not to become a cover for the World Bank.

In this connection he urged participants to take seriously the message that they could each make a difference in their districts, regions, organisations, country, the continent and beyond, pointing out that that was where CIVISOC came in. The question in his view was ensuring that people's voices would be heard and unless participants became activators of this, nothing would really change.

He went on to say that it was critical to understand the difference between listening and understanding, between understanding and taking on board actively. Being listened to was not enough. What was important was for people to make sure that they would be involved in delivery to guarantee that the outcome would be right.

The Chairman spoke finally on the absence of politics in the discussion. Built into SAPRI, he remarked, was a level of depoliticisation that reduced it to a research and conversation activity. He recognised that there was a place for research and conversation. But when however the whole enterprise became just that, it ran the risk of assuming that the issue at stake was debate, clarification and persuasion rather than the vested interests in the whole enterprise. Explaining further, he said that good research had the value of removing cobwebs to enable people see more clearly what reality was and therefore was an instrument to be used. The question however was whether participants could use the instrument to defend their interests, especially against others, internal as well as external?

## **10.0 VOTE OF THANKS**

Mrs D. Coker Appiah expressed gratitude on behalf of the Tripartite National Steering Committee for a process that, according to her, had gone on for three and half years.

She reminded participants that both the independent Chairman and the Chairman of CIVISOC had paid tribute to some people and organisations that had helped with the process over the last three years. She did not think that acknowledging those organisations and people yet again did any harm. She therefore proceeded to recognise the support given by the main sponsors of the SAPRI process, the World Bank, the Government of Ghana and the global SAPRI Secretariat.

She also acknowledged funding assistance from the Canadian International Development Agency, the UNDP and the African Development Fund in support of activities carried out in the country.

She paid tribute to the independent Chairman, Prof. Akilagpa Sawyerr, commenting that his choice as Chairman was the most strategic decision that CIVISOC had made as his name opened doors whenever that was required and that his steering of the Forum over the three days was testimony of his ability.

She thanked the SAPRI Secretariat, those in the background as well those in the foreground, for their invaluable support, the Rapporteur General and Rapporteurs as well as CIVISOC members for their hard work.

She was also grateful to all invited guests noting that their continued presence since the opening ceremony was unusual because people tended to leave after the main guest speaker had spoken. She therefore thanked all for coming.

## APPENDIX A

### THE SECOND NATIONAL SAPRI FORUM ACCRA, MAY 7-9, 2001

#### PROGRAMME

DAY ONE MONDAY MAY 7, 2001

0730 – 0900 **ARRIVAL, REGISTRATION, AND SEATING OF GUESTS**

0915 – 1100 **OPENING**

#### **Welcome And Introduction**

Dr. E. O. Akwetey – SAPRI Technical Liaison Officer

#### **Introductory Remarks:**

Prof. Akilagpa Sawyerr, TNSC Chairman

#### **OPENING STATEMENTS**

- **Global Overview Of SAPRI**

Douglas Hellinger, SAPRI Secretariat, Washington DC

- **SAPRI In Ghana**

Kwesi Adu-Amankwah, T. U. C. Secretary General, Chairman Of  
CIVISOC

Dr. G. A. Agambila, Representative Of Minister Of Finance

Peter Harold, Country Director, World Bank

#### **Keynote Address:**

Hon. Dr. Kwesi Nduom, Minister For Economic Planning And Regional  
Integration

For H. E. President J. A. Kufuor

#### **Closing Remarks**

Prof. Akilagpa Sawyerr - TNSC Chairman

TEA/COFFEE/COCOA BREAK

1115-1300 PLENARY SESSION

#### **GHANA'S SAPRI RESEARCH REPORT**

##### **Introduction:**

Sector Reports - TRADE - Dr. Romanus Dinye, KNUST, Kumasi  
- EDUCATION - Prof. Agyeman, U.C.C. Cape Coast  
- MINING - Thomas Akabza, University of Ghana,

Legon

Korle Bu	- HEALTH	- S. K. Avle, Ghana Medical School,
	<b>Discussion:</b>	-
	<b>Chair:</b>	- Akilagpa Sawyerr
	<b>Rapporteur:</b>	- Akua Britwum, University of Cape Coast - Theophilus Richardson, University of Ghana, Legon
1300 – 1400	<b>LUNCH:</b>	
<b>1415-1730</b>	<b>SYNDICATE / GROUP WORK SESSIONS</b>	
	<b>1) REPORT ON TRADE</b>	- Dr. Romanus Dinye, Knust
	<b>Discussant</b>	- Rene Bonnell, The World Bank, Washington
	<b>Discussions:</b>	
Accra	<b>Chair:</b>	- John Atta Nyamekye, Densu Industries, (AGI),
	<b>Rapporteur:</b>	- Dr. F.D. Tay, Economic Consultant - Dr. Abdul Nashiru Isahaku, TWN Africa
	<b>2) REPORT ON EDUCATION</b>	- Prof. D. K. Agyeman, U.C.C.
Education	<b>Discussant</b>	- Hon. M. Ibn Chambas, MP, Ex Deputy Minister of
Ghana, Legon		<b>Discussions</b>
	<b>Chair:</b>	- Dr. Ellen Bortei Doku Aryeetey, ISSER, University of
	<b>Rapporteur:</b>	- Akua Britwum
	<b>3) REPORT ON MINING-</b>	Thomas Akabza, University Of Ghana, Legon.
	<b>Discussant:</b>	- Prof Songsori, University of Ghana, Legon
	<b>Discussion:</b>	
Government	<b>Chair:</b>	- Mrs. Esther Ofei Aboagye, Institute of Local
		Studies, Dunkowaa, (ILGS)
	<b>Rapporteur:</b>	- Kwesi Jonah, University of Ghana, Legon
	<b>4) REPORT ON HEALTH-</b>	S. K. Avle, Ghana Medical School, Korle Bu
UK,	<b>Discussant:</b>	- Gregg Gram / Vicky Okine, Save the Children,
		Ghana Country Programme
	<b>Discussion:</b>	
	<b>Chair:</b>	- Mrs. Dorcas Coker Appiah, Gender Centre
	<b>Rapporteur:</b>	- George Cann, Ag. Chief Director, Ministry Of Economic Planning and Regional Integration

## END OF DAY 1 PROCEEDINGS

DAY TWO TUESDAY, MAY 8, 2001

**0830 –1230** SYNDICATE / GROUP WORK SESSIONS

CONTINUATION

*REPORT WRITING*

1300 – 1745 LUNCH BREAK

1430 – 1630 **PLENARY  
PRESENTATION OF SYNDICATE REPORTS**

Chair: - Mrs. D. Coker Appiah

Rapporteur: -

**MID AFTERNOON BREAK**

1800 **REFRESHMENT / COCKTAIL**

END OF DAY 2 PROCEEDINGS

DAY THREE WEDNESDAY, MAY 9, 2001

**9000-1030** PLENARY SESSION I

*Panel Discussion:*

**The Way Forward**

CIVISOC - Mr. Adu Amankwah

SAPRI Africa Office - Dr. Yao Graham

GOG - Dr. G. A. Agambila

World Bank - Mr. Peter Harold

SAPRIN SECT - Mr. Doug Hellniger

Chair: - Professor A. Sawyer

Rapporteur – K. Jonah  
Dr. Issahaku

1030 **TEA / COFFEE BREAK**

1045 – 1200 **RAPPORTEUR GENERAL'S REPORT**

Mr. Aloysius Dankabe, University of Ghana, Legon  
Chair: Prof. Akilagpa Sawyer

1215 – 1330

**CLOSING CEREMONY**

Prof. Akilagpa Sawyerr, CHAIRMAN OF TNSC.

**Vote Of Thanks**

Mrs Dorcas Coker Appiah

1330

**LUNCH / END OF DAY THREE PROCEEDINGS**

**APPENDIX B**

**SPEECHES:**

## APPENDIX C

### **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| 1. <b>G. K. Mensah</b><br>TUC<br>Box 16, Ada<br><b>Telephone: 0968-22224</b> | 2. <b>G. K. Bedzrah</b><br>Box 363, Ho   |
| 3. <b>Sadik Y. Bukari</b><br>TUC<br>Box 198<br><i>Telephone: 071-22026</i>   | 4. <b>Frank – Cofie (SNR)</b><br>Dambai Training College<br>Box 84, Kete Krachie |
| 5. <b>Alhassan Imoru</b>   | 6. <b>J. B. Yegbe</b>  |

RUMNET  
Box 863, Tamale  
Telefax: 071-24177  
Email: [rumnet@africaonline.com.gh](mailto:rumnet@africaonline.com.gh)

Box 1, Abor  
Telephone: 0902-210267

7. **N. D. Sodzi**  
SOVAK Consultancy  
Box 4304, Ho  
Telephone: 091-28013

8. **S. Oppong-Boadi**  
A.S.S.I  
BOX 1288, Koforidua  
Telephone: 08123639

9. **Gordon Bodza**  
TUC  
Box 122, Sunyani  
Telephone: 061-25575  
Email: [yembodza@yahoo.com](mailto:yembodza@yahoo.com)

10. **Justice Samuel Adjei**  
N.M.P.  
Box 25, Sunyani  
Telephone: 061-27041

11. **Josephine Boamah**  
TUC  
Box 122, Sunyani  
Telephone: 061-25575  
20241

12. **S. Amoako Kwateng**  
District Assembly  
Box 15, Effiduase-Ashanti  
Telephone: 051-

13. **Nana Asumadu Sakyi**  
District Assembly  
Box 12, Ejisu  
Telephone: 051-20192  
34010

14. **Margaret Minnah**  
G.R.N.A  
Box 1363, Cape Coast  
Telephone: 042-

15. **W. P. Awuah**  
TUC  
Box 99, Suhum  
Telephone: 0858-22143  
20108

16. **H. A. Balbaare**  
TUC  
Box 156, Wa  
Telephone: 0756-

17. **Richard Asueme**  
TUC  
Box 126, Bolgatanga  
Telephone: 072-23019/23285

18. **Kofi Gbedemah**  
Box MA 279, Ho  
Telephone: 091-28360/27543  
Email: [coranet2@yahoo.com](mailto:coranet2@yahoo.com)

19. **Johannes A. M. Awudza**  
**CEDEP**  
Department of Chemistry  
KNUST, Kumasi

20. **John E. S. Davis**  
**District Assembly**  
Box E.37, Effia-Takoradi  
Telephone: 020-8115718

*Telephone: 051-60305*  
*Email: [Johannes-Awudza@yahoo.com](mailto:Johannes-Awudza@yahoo.com)*

21. **Joe Quaguarine**  
G.E.S.  
Box 346, Sekondi  
**Telephone: 031-46044  
26252**
22. **Al-hassan Seidu**  
UDS  
Box 1350, UDS-Tamale  
**Telephone: 071-**
23. **Abuborfour-Sarpong**  
TUC  
Box 122, Sunyani
24. **Kwabena Afena-Sam**  
BANGO  
Box 2104, Sunyani  
*Telephone: 061-24867*
25. **Selasie S. Mortoti**  
KNUST-School of Medical School  
R14 Clinical Students Hostel, KATH  
*Email: [selasiem@hotmail.com](mailto:selasiem@hotmail.com)*
26. **James Wilberforce Biney**  
U.C.C.-GNATOC  
C/O GNATOC  
University of Cape Coast
27. **Salifu Amadu**  
GNAT  
Box 204, Bolgatanga  
**Telephone: 0756-22156  
22156**
28. **A. Adams-Sandu**  
TUC  
Box 156, Wa  
**Telephone: 0756-**
29. **Sumani Harruna**  
GNAT  
Box 125, Navrongo  
*Telephone: 0745-24085*
30. **A. B.Ibn Hassan**  
Moslem Community/YWMA  
Box SC674, Sekondi  
*Telephone: 031-46238*  
*Email: [abibnhassan@usa.net](mailto:abibnhassan@usa.net)*
31. **John Gershon Koomson**  
NBSSI Box 27, Sekondi  
*Telephone: 031-46498*  
*[koomsonjg@yahoo.com](mailto:koomsonjg@yahoo.com)*
32. **Issah Seidu**  
GNAT  
Box 50, Tamale  
*Telephone: 071-23997*
33. **Helena A. Gadzekpo**  
CSA  
*Telephone: 666581*
34. **S. K. Awunyo-Akaba**  
FUGI/REHOCONSULT  
Box MA 132, Ho
35. **K. Safo-Kantanka**  
ENOWID Foundation  
Box 875, Sunyani

**Telephone: 091-27087  
23011**

**Telephone: 061-**

**36. Kwaku Asante-Nketiah**  
GNAT  
Box 323, Sunyani  
**Telephone: 061-25109/23281  
23388**

**37. Kusi-Kyere George**  
GNAT  
Box 134, Sunyani  
**Telephone: 061-**

**38. Felicia Takrama**  
GRASAG  
UCC/Cape Coast

**39. S.M.A. Nabengyey**  
GNAT  
Box 435, Tamale  
*Telephone: 071-22378*

**40. SGT. S.C. Baidoo**  
Ghana Police  
Box 2, Abuakwa-Ash  
**Telephone: 051-50304  
22520**

**41. Kofi Lucas**  
AFA Foundation  
Box 2603, Koforidua  
**Telephone: 081-**

**42. S. B. Danaa**  
GNAT  
Box 139, Wa  
*Telephone: 0756-22358*

**43. B. O. Ashun**  
SSNIT, Takoradi  
*Telephone: 020-815961*

**44. Donyuo S.S.B**  
Box 151, Wa  
*Telephone: 0756-22100*

**45. Stephen B. Kpen**  
District Assembly  
Box 23, Laura  
*Telephone: 0756-22804*

**46. Samuel Macarthy**  
GRNA  
Box 153, Ho  
**Telephone: Res. 091-27111  
890361**

**47. Mahama Jacob**  
GRNA  
Box 16, Tamale  
**Telephone: 027-**

*Off. 091-26704*  
**48. Anaffu Rashid Tee**  
U.C.E.W  
Box 25, Winneba  
**Telephone: 0432-22140/22139  
23264/23464/**

**49. Asante Asubonteng**  
C. Sawarts Association  
Box 361, Sunyani  
**Telephone: 061-**

*020-2018268*

**50. Harry Pieteron**  
TUC

**51. Mohammed Ibn Chambas**  
Parliament House

Box 423, Koforidua  
*Telephone: 081-22723*

*Telephone: 024-314160/  
508233*

52. **Hagan Y. Enni**  
University of Ghana

53. **Edwin Tettey**  
ALERT  
Box M274  
*Telephone: 024-386982*  
*Email: [eddyde@yahoo.com](mailto:eddyde@yahoo.com)*

54. **Hon. E.A. Agyepong**  
Parliament House  
*Telephone: 020-8123451*  
**North**  
*Telephone: 306069*

55. **Vitus Azeem**  
ISODEC  
**Box AN 19452, Accra-**  
  
[vazeem@isodec.org.gh](mailto:vazeem@isodec.org.gh)

56. **Chris Amankwah Asante**  
Student  
C/O Mr. Isaac Saah  
GNFS Box 4129, H/Q Accra

57. **Professor D. K. Agyeman**  
Dept. of Sociology, UCC  
*Telephone: 042-32802*  
*024-333248*

58. **Orisha Afa**  
Community Action  
Box 308, Ho  
*Telephone: 091-26945*

59. **Edward Amanor**  
Dept. of Chemistry (KNUST)  
PMB, UPO Kumasi  
*Telephone: 024-283173*  
[edwardamanor@hotmail.com](mailto:edwardamanor@hotmail.com)

60. **Regina Arthur**  
Sunyani Women Concern Forum  
Box 500

61. **Evans Anyane**  
NBSSI-Kumasi  
Box 38, RCC  
*Telephone: 051-25426*

62. **Christina Opoku**  
GES  
Box 62, UPO KNUST

63. **G.W. Tuu**  
Civil Servant Association  
Box 151, Wa  
*Telephone: 0756-20193*

64. **Alex Dogbe**  
NBSSI  
Box 56, Bolgatanga  
**Telephone: 072-23306**  
**23253**

65. **Felix Kwaku**  
Minerals Commission  
Box 475, Bolgatanga  
**Telephone: 072-**

66. **Simon Atebiya**

67. **E. K. Akoto**

- Minerals Commission  
Box 475, Bolgatanga  
**Telephone: 072-23253  
26948**
68. **Mary Akposoe**  
Coranet  
Box 308, Ho  
**Telephone: 091-26468  
23517**
70. **Thomas Baafi**  
GNAT  
Box 39, Ajumako
72. **Elizabeth Fiadjoe**  
TUC  
Box 405, Takoradi  
*Telephone: 031-23536/26504*
74. **Christie Carl Oparebea**  
Box 123, Sekondi  
*Telephone: 031-46612*
76. **Dan D. Biitir**  
NORYDA  
Box 50, Tamale
78. **Ebenezer Okine**  
Ghana Institute of Planners  
Box 2163, Christianborg  
**Telephone: 261214**
80. **Odame Agyei**  
GNAT  
Box 1214, Accra-North
82. **Ekua Ansah-Eshon**  
NCWD  
Box 304, Sekondi  
*Telephone: 031-46940*
- ASSI  
Box 450, Ho  
**Telephone 091-**
69. **Miriam Ofosu Appiah**  
GAWE/ASSI  
Box 655, Koforidua  
**Telephone: 081-**
71. **Owusu Hammond**  
Box 252, Takoradi  
*Telephone: 031-22531  
031-30047*
73. **Alfred E. Fumador**  
TEWU/TUC  
Box 347, Cape Coast  
*042-32766*
75. **Francis Badie-Brown**  
GNAC  
Box 118L, Achimota  
*Telephone: 401617*
77. **K. K. Blay**  
Japanese Embassy  
*Telephone: 765061-3*
79. **B. K. Osei**  
GNAT  
Box 344, Cape Coast  
**Telephone: 042-33062**
81. **Ernest Asigri**  
Box CT 482, Accra  
*Telephone: 229062*
83. **Anita Tetteh**  
GBC Radio Newsroom  
*Telephone: 223012*  
[anitatetteh@yahoo.com.gh](mailto:anitatetteh@yahoo.com.gh)

Email: [ncwd@tdpo.africaonline.com.gh](mailto:ncwd@tdpo.africaonline.com.gh)

84. **K. Y. Kyei**  
Adinkafo Progressive Fund  
Box AB 13  
Telephone: 024-281547  
Email: [okyei2@yahoo.com](mailto:okyei2@yahoo.com)
85. **Kofi Agyen**  
World Bank  
P. O. Box M27, Accra  
Telephone: 229681/227887  
[kagyen@worldbank.org](mailto:kagyen@worldbank.org)
86. **Evelyn Avittor**  
World Bank  
P. O. Box M27, Accra  
Telephone: 229681/227887  
Email: [ewittor@worldbankorg](mailto:ewittor@worldbankorg)
87. **Charles Abbey**  
ADP  
Box CT 3918, Cantonments  
Telephone: 306345  
[chasadp@africaonline.com.gh](mailto:chasadp@africaonline.com.gh)
88. **Theophilus Tetteh**  
S. Aid, Kumasi  
Box 14293
89. **A. Evans Lutterodt**  
CRS  
Box 6333, Accra-North  
Fax: 777099
90. **Diana Ayettey**  
NCWD  
Box M53, Accra  
Telephone: 229119
91. **Bernard Vikpeh-Lartey**  
CEDEP  
Box 11299, Accra-North  
Telephone: 244537/8  
Fax: 244539
92. **Barbara Ghansah**  
UG  
Box 62, Teshie-Nungua  
Telephone: 024-230162  
Email: [kuleywaa@xmail.com](mailto:kuleywaa@xmail.com)
93. **Pethwel Danyo**  
Council of State Sec.  
Box 46, State House  
Telephone: 662349
94. **Kwamina Ato Arkorful**  
Civil Servants Association  
P. O. Box 21, Wa
95. **J. O. Adjei**  
GES Metro Kumasi  
Box 1918  
Telephone: 024-282537
96. **C. A. Bob-Millar (Mrs)**  
NCWD  
Box 151  
Telephone: 0756-22280  
22280
97. **K. Ahenakwa-Quarshie**  
GNAT  
Box 438, Suhum  
Telephone: 0858-
98. **Felix A. Lartey**  
GNAT  
Box 98, Koforidua
99. **Emelia Abdulai**  
Walaria Primary  
Box 309, Bolgatanga

Telephone: 027-609316

Telephone: 027-22869

100. **Agnes Owusu-Darko**  
GNAT  
Box 115, Koforidua  
Telephone: 081-23346
101. **Mary Avorseh**  
GRNA  
Box 201, Koforidua  
Telephone: 081-23011
102. **S. D. Aknoneg**  
CSA  
Box 201, Koforidua  
Telephone: 081-23011/28296
103. **Christiana Amarchey**  
ACTIONAID  
Box 1057  
Telephone: 071-22740
104. **Kwamina Dadzie Dennis**  
CSA  
Box 81, Cape Coast  
Telephone: 042-32784
105. **Charles Gomez**  
GAEG  
Phone: 031-21944/31427  
Email: [mexy@mail.com](mailto:mexy@mail.com)
106. **Abdul N. Issahka**  
**TWN Africa**  
Box 14678, GPO, Accra  
Telephone: 021-500419 Ext 113  
Email: [nashirus@yahoo.com](mailto:nashirus@yahoo.com)
107. **M. A. Nai**  
**ASSI**  
Box A411, La  
Telephone: 021-660039
108. **Samuel Dzikunu**  
Child Assistance for Dev't  
Box 135, Ho  
Telephone: 091-26511  
Email: [cad.sppo@africaonline.com.gh](mailto:cad.sppo@africaonline.com.gh)
109. **Tetteh A. Kofi**  
VSF  
C/O Kumoji Clinic  
Box 8888, Accra-North  
Telephone: 021-712175  
Email: [kofi@USFCA.EPU](mailto:kofi@USFCA.EPU)
110. **Aureol A. Kotey**  
University of Ghana  
Box 328, Legon  
Telephone: 022-207299
111. **Patricia Oxley Young**  
CIDA-Governance & Civil  
Society Support Project  
Box 163, Accra  
Telephone 772861/773598  
Email: [civisoc@cidupsu.org](mailto:civisoc@cidupsu.org)
112. **Professor Jacob Songsore**  
University of Ghana  
Box LG659, Legon  
Telephone: 500394  
Email: [j\\_songsore@hotmail.com](mailto:j_songsore@hotmail.com)
113. **Leowa Kyeremateng**  
National Governance  
Program (N.I.R.D)  
Box 1618  
Telephone: 672334
114. **Dr. Linda Van Otoo**  
Ministry of Health  
Box 187, Sekondi
115. **Hassan A. Sumanu**  
OATUU  
Box M386, Accra

Telephone: 027-207114  
Email: [amarlinete@usa.net](mailto:amarlinete@usa.net)

Telephone: 508855  
Fax: 508851/53  
Email: [oatuu@ighmail.com](mailto:oatuu@ighmail.com)

116. **Nii Okine Okantey**  
SSNIT  
Box M149, Accra  
Telephone: 668684

117. **Alex Oteng**  
CSA  
Box 29, Elmina  
Telephone: 042-33512

118. **J. A. Osei**  
WACAM  
Box 558, Tarkwa  
Telephone: 0362-20137

119. **Ekua Tandoh**  
S.A.E.M.A  
Box 74, Sekondi  
Telephone: 031-46372-5

120. **Augustus K. Ackon**  
LGWU/TUC  
Box 347, Cape Coast  
Telephone: 042-23766

121. **Philomena Johnson**  
NDPC  
Box C633  
Telephone: 773011-3

122. **Kwasi Adu-Amankwah**  
TUC/CivisoC  
Box 701  
Telephone: 669675

123. **Anthony Jones**  
American Int. Labour  
Solidarity Centre  
1925 K ST NW Washington  
DC.  
Telephone: 1-202-778-4617

124. **Kofi Owusu Bempah**  
Office of the President  
State House  
Telephone: 676927

125. **Juichi Sato**  
JICA  
Box 6402, Accra-North  
Telephone: 238419

126. **Joe Taabazuing**  
National Catholic Secretariat  
Box KA 9712, Airport-Accra  
Telephone: 500126

127. **Daniel Hagan**  
Ministry of Trade & Industry  
Box M47, Accra  
Telephone: 664776

128. **Doug Hellinger**  
The Development GAP  
927 15B ST, NW 4<sup>TH</sup> Floor  
Washington DC, USA  
Telephone: 1-202-898-1566-1612

129. **J. K. Ansere**  
Ansly Ed. Construction  
Box L31, Legon  
Telephone: 502956

130. **Mirjam de Hoon**  
CAPSDH  
Box AN7286, Accra

131. Angela Adama  
IMPACT  
Box CT 3583, Accra

Telephone: 774526/552455  
Email: [Rabito@ighmail.com](mailto:Rabito@ighmail.com)

Telephone: 024-231239/  
021-230491  
Email: [impacts@usa.net](mailto:impacts@usa.net)

132. **K.K.K. Ampofo**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Ghana  
Box 70, Legon  
Telephone: 027-6050451  
Fax: 502385  
Email: [kingsleyampofo@hotmail.com](mailto:kingsleyampofo@hotmail.com)
133. **Theodore Markham**  
T-Mark Consulting  
Box GP 18485, GPO  
Telephone: 768623/  
020-8117397  
[tmarkham@africanonline](mailto:tmarkham@africanonline)
134. **K. A. Simpson**  
**GNAT**  
Box 591, Koforidua  
Telephone: 081-22746
135. **Frank Tufuor**  
**GNAT**  
Box 434, Koforidua  
Telephone: 081-24791
136. **Wisdom Mensah**  
International Needs  
Box DS 690, Dansoman  
Telephone: 226620  
Email: [intneeds@gh.com](mailto:intneeds@gh.com)
137. **Yao Dogbe**  
GAPVOD  
Box A17, La  
Telephone: 254670  
Email: [gapvod@ghana.com](mailto:gapvod@ghana.com)
138. **Alhaji S. A. Wahab**  
Muslim Relief Ass. Of Ghana  
Box 8749, Accra-North  
Telephone: 248068  
Email: [murag@africaonline.com.gh](mailto:murag@africaonline.com.gh)
139. **Roland Acquah-Stanley**  
Radio Gold  
Box 19728, Accra  
Telephone: 300281/284
140. **Ferdinand D. Tay**  
CAG  
Telephone: 020-8119966
141. **Alhaji Alhassan Abdulai**  
ICODEHS  
Box 17070, Accra  
Telephone: 223518
142. **Hajia Nnaa**  
ICODEHS  
Box 17070, Accra  
Telephone: 223518
143. **Diibril T. Camara**  
Guinea Embassy  
Box 5497  
Telephone: 760961
144. **Felix Okwaning**  
Development Cumultas  
Box 9245  
Telephone: 502275
145. **Berliel de Langa**  
Netherlands Embassy  
Box 3248
146. **Steffen Rasmusio**  
IBIS -DIC  
P.M.B Osu
147. **Jerry Quartey**  
Child Assistance for Dev't  
Box 14049, Accra

- Telephone: 772364*
148. **G. N. Kandeo**  
AMA  
**Box 385, Acc.**  
*Telephone: 024-273143*
150. **Derick Ashley**  
CSIR  
Box 32, Accra  
*Telephone: 761240*
152. **Abdulai Darimani**  
TWN  
Box 19452, Accra-North  
*Telephone: 511189/88*  
*Email: [tw@ghana.com](mailto:tw@ghana.com)*
154. **Dorcas Coker-Appiah**  
Gender Centre  
Box AN 6692, Accra-North  
*Telephone: 760687/8*  
*Email: [gencentre@its.com.gh](mailto:gencentre@its.com.gh)*
156. **Kwasi Anhwere**  
Civil Servants Association  
Box M336, Accra  
*Telephone: 228079*
158. **Frank Boakye-Dankwah**  
GAPVOD  
Box A17, La-Accra  
*Telephone: 021-254672*  
*Email: [gapvod@gh.com](mailto:gapvod@gh.com)*
160. **Sneyampong**  
Office of the President  
**Castle Osu**  
*Telephone: 664631*
162. **D. Ayim Antwi**  
TEWU/TUC  
Box GP701, Accra
- Telephone: 764803*
149. **T. E. Pieteron**  
Sociology Dept. UG, Legon  
**Box 1965, Legon**  
*Telephone: 502217*
151. **Oduro Donkor**  
PRONET  
Box P.M.B. KIA, Accra  
*Telephone: 228206*  
*Email: [pronet@ncs.com](mailto:pronet@ncs.com)*
153. **Edward Awuah Nyamekye**  
Minerals Commission  
Box M248, Accra  
*Telephone 772783/6*
155. **Zo Dandriamaro**  
TWN Africa  
Box 19452, Accra-North  
*Telephone: 511189*  
*: [twnafrica@ghana.com](mailto:twnafrica@ghana.com)*
157. **Mawuko Fumey**  
Nature Conservative Reg.  
Centre  
Box KN 925, Kaneshie  
***Telephone: 231765***  
*Email: [ncrc@ghana.com](mailto:ncrc@ghana.com)*
159. **Hon. Alban Bagbin**  
Parliament House  
*Telephone: 663325*
161. **A.K. Tawiah**  
NGO  
**Box 14544, Accra**  
*Telephone: 667614*
163. **Zenabu Wasau**  
EPA  
Box 80, Bolgatanga

Telephone: 662100

Telephone: 23187  
[epauer@africaonline.com](mailto:epauer@africaonline.com)

164. **Kofi Marrah**  
World Bank  
Box M27, Accra  
Telephone: 229681  
Fax: 227887  
Email: [Kmarrah@worldbank.org](mailto:Kmarrah@worldbank.org)
165. **Stanley Atiapah**  
Min. of Manpower Dev't &  
Employment  
Box M55  
Telephone: 664571
166. **James Sambian**  
Ghana Society for the Blind  
Box GP 3065, Accra  
Telephone: 221614  
Fax: 230831  
Email: [socblind@ghana.com](mailto:socblind@ghana.com)
167. **S.K. Avle**  
U.G.M.S  
Box 4236, aCCRA  
Telephone: 020-8133946  
[seba-avle@yahoo.com](mailto:seba-avle@yahoo.com)
168. **Peter Harrold**  
World Bank  
Box M27  
Telephone: 229681  
Email: [pharrold@worldbank.org](mailto:pharrold@worldbank.org)
169. **Ike Duker**  
Crown Agents  
Box GP 565, Accra  
Telephone: 669798/669799
170. **Yongmei Zhan**  
World Bank  
Box M27, Accra  
Telephone: 772524  
Email: [yzhou1@worldbank.org](mailto:yzhou1@worldbank.org)
171. **Beatrice Duncan**  
UNICEF  
Box 5051  
Telephone: 772524  
Email: [bduncan@unicef.org](mailto:bduncan@unicef.org)
172. **Dr. Phologane**  
**South African High Commission**  
Telephone: 764500
173. **Jav. D Pessey**  
**Reform Party**  
Box CT 1334, Accra  
Telephone: 024-254590/  
021-7011393  
[dnlpeney@hotmail.com](mailto:dnlpeney@hotmail.com)
174. **A. Denkabe**  
University of Ghana  
Box 129, Legon  
Telephone: 027-604688  
Email: [adenkabe@hotmail.com](mailto:adenkabe@hotmail.com)
175. **Nene S. Tetteh**  
CSIR  
Box 438, Accra
176. **E.I.M.B. Amoakwah**  
Business Executive  
Box 8451, Accra-North
177. **Noah Boateng**  
N.C.S  
Box 9064, Accra

Email: [eiamoakwah@hotmail.com](mailto:eiamoakwah@hotmail.com)

178. **Fritz Damenu**  
N.C.S  
Box 9064, Accra
179. **Awudu A. Gumah**  
OATUU  
Box M386  
Telephone: 508855-56  
Email: [ootuu@ighmail.com](mailto:ootuu@ighmail.com)
180. **Sam Poku**  
Institute of Economic Affairs  
28 Independence Ave. Accra  
Telephone: 253805  
Email: [iea@gh.com](mailto:iea@gh.com)
181. **M. Bawumia**  
Bank of Ghana  
Box 2674, Accra  
Telephone: 666174  
[mbawumia@bog.gov.org.gh](mailto:mbawumia@bog.gov.org.gh)
182. **Kassim Yahya**  
Bank of Ghana  
Box 2674, Accra  
Telephone: 663082  
[kassimyahya@bog.gov.gh](mailto:kassimyahya@bog.gov.gh)
183. **Albert Boateng**  
EPA  
Box M266, Accra
184. **Nana Andoh**  
EPA  
**Box M266, Accra**
185. **Dr. R. D. Dinye**  
Dept of Housing & Planning  
**Research**  
Telephone: 051-60308
186. **Sefa Boakye**  
UG, Legon
187. **David Quist**  
MOF/WB Desk  
**Box M40, Accra**  
Telephone: 686186
188. **Professor Akilapa Sawyerr**  
**AAU**  
**Industries/CivisoC**  
Airport, Accra
189. **J. Atta-Nyamekye**  
**Densu**  
  
Box 2886, Accra  
Telephone: 222452/224450
190. **Kojo Twumasi**  
National Dev. Plan Committee  
Box AN 10978, Accra-North  
Telephone: 020-8115152
191. **S. N. Nonterah**  
NSC  
Box 83, Accra  
Telephone: 032202101
192. **John Klinogo**
193. **Akua O. Britwum**

Pricewater Coopers  
Box CT42, Accra  
Telephone: 506217

CDS/UCC  
(Off) 042-329883

194. **S. E. Ocran**  
MOTC  
Box M38, Accra  
Telephone: 667323

195. **Embassy of Japan**  
Box 1639, Accra  
Telephone: 765060

196. **Kwesi Ampondah**  
NUGS  
**Box 157, Legon**  
Telephone: 660910

197. **Rita Yankah**  
GNAT  
**Box LG672, Legon**  
Telephone: 665534/502778

198. **Sheikh Mustaph Ibrahim**  
Islamic Council  
Box 5303, Accra  
Telephone: 221498

199. **Emmanuel A. Allotey**  
CSIR (FRI)  
Box M20, Accra  
Telephone: 777330

200. **Kathy Gusach**  
Gender Centre  
Box 6A2, Accra-North  
Telephone: 760688/7  
Email: [gencentre@its.com.gh](mailto:gencentre@its.com.gh)

201. **Eleanor Ohene**  
GNAT  
Box TN 1607  
Telephone: 716290

202. **Gifty A. Apanbil**  
GNAT  
**Box TN 1607**  
Telephone: 716290

203. **Alfred Appiah**  
GNECC  
**Box A17, La -Accra**  
Telephone: 020-8128407

204. **William Kwasi Quao**  
RURAL IMPACT  
Box DC250, Dansoman  
Telephone: 311625

205. **Togbe Adom Drau 111**  
TUC  
Box B455, Ho  
Telephone: 091-26499

206. **Nii Badu Botchwey**  
LANDA  
Box A589  
Telephone: 673412

207. **Fati Salamims**  
GNAT  
ORIELLY SS  
Box 238, Accra  
Telephone: 226787

208. **David Andoh**  
Financial Post

209. **Kofi Adu**  
GAPVOD

**Box 8377, Accra**  
*Telephone: 238038*

**Box A17, La -Accra**  
*Telephone: 254670/1*

210. **Jane Adomako**  
**Box MP2853**  
*Telephone: 250375*

211. **Ahmed Osuman**  
**Office of Imam**  
Box 125, Nima  
*Telephone: 027-881459*

212. **Jacob Laryea**  
G.U.N.A  
**Box 46, State House**  
*Telephone: 666017*

213. **Francis V. Ekey**  
Ministry of Health  
**Box MB44, Accra**  
*Telephone: 6613545*  
[francisekey@hotmail.com](mailto:francisekey@hotmail.com)

214. **Awotwe Nkansah**  
GNAT  
Box 209, Accra  
*Telephone: 221515*

216. **Fred Daramani**  
Innovision  
Box AN 19452, Accra-North

217. **Ernest Annan**  
Innovision  
Box AN 19452, Accra-North

218. **Evans Amankwah**  
Innovision  
Box AN 19452, Accra-North

219. **A. M. K. Joris**  
CSA  
Box M.336  
*Telephone: 666581*

220. **Eric O. Laate**  
L.M.K.  
Box LA92  
*Telephone: 760689*

221. **Wolatuv Deborah Oklu**  
G.E.S  
La Wireless "5" JSS  
Box 64, La

222. **Vicky T. Okine**  
Save the Children  
Box C976, Cantonments

223. **Professor Cletus Dordunoo**  
Clay Dord Ent. Ltd  
**Box LG46, Legon-Accra**  
*Email: [ekdordunoo@yahoo.co.uk](mailto:ekdordunoo@yahoo.co.uk)*

224. **Greg Ramm**  
Save the Children  
**Box C976, Cantonments**

225. **C. Ameyaw Akumfi**  
Ministry of Education  
Box M45, Accra

226. **Marian Tadifa-Kubdon**  
CIDA-PSU  
*Telephone: 7011728*  
*Email: [marian@cidapsu.com](mailto:marian@cidapsu.com)*

227. **E. Ofori-Gyamfi**  
COCOBOD

228. **Ali Musa**  
GNAT

Box 933, Accra  
Telephone: 221212

Box 95, Wa

229. **George Guri**  
GNAT  
Box 95, Wa  
Telephone: 0753-22604
230. **Thomas Akabzaa**  
TWN  
Box LG58, Legon  
Telephone: 021-507216  
[kakabzaa@ug.edu.gh](mailto:kakabzaa@ug.edu.gh)
231. **Lucia Quachey**  
GAWE  
Box AN7600, Accra-North  
Telephone: 225300/222459  
Email: [gawe@ighmail.com](mailto:gawe@ighmail.com)
232. **A.C. Vermeer**  
Embassy of Netherland  
Thomas Sankara Circle  
B.P. 3248  
Telephone: 021-231991  
[andrevermeer@minbuza.nl](mailto:andrevermeer@minbuza.nl)
233. **V. E. Senanu**  
UCC  
Box 113  
Telephone: 021-500035
234. **Balertey Gormey**  
Green Earth Organisation  
Box 16441, Accra  
Telephone: 232762
235. **Kwasi Osei**  
TRI-STAR Consultants  
Box 12566, Accra-North  
Telephone: 233015
236. **Esther Offei Aboagye**  
Institute of Local  
Government Studies (ILGS)  
Box 549, Legon  
Telephone: 508817  
Email: [ilgs@ighmail.com](mailto:ilgs@ighmail.com)
237. **Mohammed K. Doku**  
CEV  
Box 5, Hwidiem  
Telephone: 061-23349  
Email: [cev.gh@yahoo.com](mailto:cev.gh@yahoo.com)
238. **Akinyoade Adenkunde**  
UCC  
Dept. of Sociology, UCC  
Telephone: 024-278587  
[akinyinka@excite.com](mailto:akinyinka@excite.com)
239. **K. K. Amarah**  
UG, Legon  
Box LA 757, LA  
Telephone: 765103
240. **William Boateng**  
UCC  
Dept. of Sociology, UCC  
Telephone: 024-283061